COMPLIANCE AUDIT

Bellevue Borough Police Pension Plan

Allegheny County, Pennsylvania For the Period January 1, 2017 to December 31, 2020

November 2021



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General

Timothy L. DeFoor • Auditor General



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General
Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018
Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General
Twitter: @PAAuditorGen
www.PaAuditor.gov

TIMOTHY L. DEFOOR AUDITOR GENERAL

The Honorable Mayor and Borough Council Bellevue Borough Allegheny County Bellevue, PA 15202

We have conducted a compliance audit of the Bellevue Borough Police Pension Plan for the period January 1, 2017 to December 31, 2020. We also evaluated compliance with some requirements subsequent to that period when possible. The audit was conducted pursuant to authority derived from the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act (Act 205 of 1984, as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.402(j)), which requires the Auditor General, as deemed necessary, to audit every municipality which receives general municipal pension system state aid and every municipal pension plan and fund in which general municipal pension system state aid is deposited. The audit was not conducted, nor was it required to be, in accordance with Government Auditing Standards issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. We planned and performed the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our conclusions based on our audit objective. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our conclusions based on our audit objective.

The objective of the audit was to determine if the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objective identified above. To determine whether the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, our methodology included the following:

• We determined whether state aid was properly determined and deposited in accordance with Act 205 requirements by verifying the annual deposit date of state aid and determining whether deposits were made within 30 days of receipt for all years within the period under audit.

- We determined whether annual employer contributions were calculated and deposited in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by examining the municipality's calculation of the plan's annual financial requirements and minimum municipal obligation (MMO) and comparing these calculated amounts to amounts actually budgeted and deposited into the pension plan as evidenced by supporting documentation.
- We determined whether annual employee contributions were calculated, deducted, and deposited into the pension plan in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by testing total members' contributions on an annual basis using the rates obtained from the plan's governing document in effect for all years within the period under audit and examining documents evidencing the deposit of these employee contributions into the pension plan.
- We determined whether retirement benefits calculated for plan members who retired and the plan member who elected to vest during the current audit period represent payments to all (and only) those entitled to receive them and were properly determined and disbursed in accordance with the plan's governing document, applicable laws, and regulations by recalculating the amount of the monthly pension benefits due to the retired individuals and comparing these amounts to supporting documentation evidencing amounts determined and actually paid to the recipients.
- We determined whether the January 1, 2017 and January 1, 2019 actuarial valuation reports were prepared and submitted by March 31, 2018 and 2020, respectively, in accordance with Act 205 and whether selected information provided on these reports is accurate, complete, and in accordance with plan provisions to ensure compliance for participation in the state aid program by comparing selected information to supporting source documentation.

Bellevue Borough contracted with an independent certified public accounting firm for annual audits of its basic financial statements for the years ended December 31, 2017 and 2018, which are available at the borough's offices. Those financial statements were not audited by us and, accordingly, we express no opinion or other form of assurance on them.

Borough officials are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the Bellevue Borough Police Pension Plan is administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies. As previously described, we tested transactions, interviewed selected officials, and performed procedures to the extent necessary to provide reasonable assurance of detecting instances of noncompliance with legal and regulatory requirements or noncompliance with provisions of contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies that are significant within the context of the audit objective.

The results of our procedures indicated that, in all significant respects, the Bellevue Borough Police Pension Plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, except as noted in the following finding further discussed later in this report:

Finding – Pension Benefits Modified Without Prior Cost Estimate

The accompanying supplementary information is presented for purposes of additional analysis. We did not audit the information or conclude on it and, accordingly, express no form of assurance on it.

The contents of this report were discussed with officials of Bellevue Borough and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report. We would like to thank borough officials for the cooperation extended to us during the conduct of the audit.

October 26, 2021

Timothy L. DeFoor Auditor General

Timothy L. Detaol

CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
Background	1
Finding and Recommendation:	
Finding – Pension Benefits Modified Without Prior Cost Estimate	2
Supplementary Information	4
Report Distribution List	8

BACKGROUND

On December 18, 1984, the Pennsylvania Legislature adopted the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act (P.L. 1005, No. 205, as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.101 et seq.). The Act established mandatory actuarial reporting and funding requirements and a uniform basis for the distribution of state aid to Pennsylvania's public pension plans.

Annual state aid allocations are provided from a 2 percent foreign (out-of-state) casualty insurance premium tax, a portion of the foreign (out-of-state) fire insurance tax designated for paid firefighters and any investment income earned on the collection of these taxes. Generally, municipal pension plans established prior to December 18, 1984, are eligible for state aid. For municipal pension plans established after that date, the sponsoring municipality must fund the plan for three plan years before it becomes eligible for state aid. In accordance with Act 205, a municipality's annual state aid allocation cannot exceed its actual pension costs.

In addition to Act 205, the Bellevue Borough Police Pension Plan is also governed by implementing regulations published at Title 16, Part IV of the Pennsylvania Code and applicable provisions of various other state statutes including, but not limited to, the following:

Act 600 - Police Pension Fund Act, Act of May 29, 1956 (P.L. 1804, No. 600), as amended, 53 P.S. § 767 et seq.

The Bellevue Borough Police Pension Plan is a single-employer defined benefit pension plan locally controlled by the provisions of Ordinance No. 10-20, as amended, adopted pursuant to Act 600. The plan is also affected by the provisions of collective bargaining agreements between the borough and its police officers. The plan was established January 1, 1958. Active members are required to contribute 5 percent of compensation to the plan. As of December 31, 2020, the plan had 13 active members, 1 terminated member eligible for vested benefits in the future, and 14 retirees receiving pension benefits from the plan.

BELLEVUE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN FINDING AND RECOMMENDATION

<u>Finding – Pension Benefits Modified Without Prior Cost Estimate</u>

Condition: The borough granted an early retirement window without preparing and submitting a cost estimate of the effect the window would have on the pension plan, as required by Act 205. On October 27, 2020, the borough adopted Ordinance No. 20-04 to provide an early retirement window to be effective from September 15, 2020 through November 30, 2020. This window provided for a full, unreduced normal retirement benefit to any police officer who retired during this time who was at least 53 years of age and completed at least 25 years of service. Only one plan participant, who was age 53 with 28 years of service, was eligible for this window and the participant elected to retire and receive a full, unreduced normal retirement benefit. If the borough had not opened this window, the plan member would only have been eligible for a reduced early retirement benefit at the time of his retirement pursuant to the provisions of the plan's governing document.

Criteria: Section 305(a) of Act 205 states:

Prior to the adoption of any benefit plan modification by the governing body of the municipality, the chief administrative officer of each pension plan shall provide to the governing body of the municipality a cost estimate of the effect of the proposed benefit plan modification.

Further, Section 305(b) of Act 205 states, in part:

If the pension plan is a defined benefit plan which is self-insured in whole or in part, the cost estimate shall be prepared by an approved actuary. . . .

The plan's governing document, Ordinance No. 10-20, at Section 4.1, *Eligibility for Normal Retirement*, states:

A Participant in the Plan may retire from active employment on the first day of the month following the attainment of age fifty-five (55); provided that the Participant has completed at least twenty-five (25) or more years of service with the Employer.

BELLEVUE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN FINDING AND RECOMMENDATION

<u>Finding – (Continued)</u>

In addition, Section 4.3, Early Retirement Benefit, states, in part:

The early retirement benefit shall be provided to a member of the police force with twenty (20) or more years of service who terminates prior to the completion of superannuation age and service requirements and who files a written application for an early retirement benefit with the governing body of the municipality or regional police department. The early retirement benefit shall become effective as of the date the application is filed with the governing body or the date designated on the application, whichever is later, and shall be the actuarial equivalent of a partial superannuation retirement benefit. . . .

<u>Cause</u>: Municipal officials stated that the decision to amend the pension plan to provide an early retirement window for police officers was made by council after deliberations in an executive session, which was not open to the public. In addition, plan officials did not obtain a cost estimate of the plan's benefit modifications because they were unfamiliar with the applicable Act 205 guidelines.

<u>Effect</u>: Benefit increases without a prior cost estimate could have a negative effect on the plan's ability to meet its current or future obligations. Act 205 requires that any unfunded liability resulting from a benefit change for active members must be amortized in 20 years and for retired members in 10 years.

<u>Recommendation</u>: We recommend that all future benefit modifications be preceded by a cost estimate in accordance with Act 205 provisions. We also recommend that plan officials ensure that the benefits provided pursuant to the early retirement window are properly reported on the January 1, 2021 actuarial valuation report.

Management's Response: Municipal officials agreed with the finding without exception.

Auditor's Conclusion: Compliance will be evaluated during our next audit of the plan.

BELLEVUE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION (UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF FUNDING PROGRESS

Historical trend information about the plan is presented herewith as supplementary information. It is intended to help users assess the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis, assess progress made in accumulating assets to pay benefits when due, and make comparisons with other state and local government retirement systems.

The actuarial information is required by Act 205 biennially. The historical information, beginning as of January 1, 2015, is as follows:

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
			Unfunded	
		Actuarial	(Assets in	
		Accrued	Excess of)	
	Actuarial	Liability	Actuarial	
Actuarial	Value of	(AAL) -	Accrued	Funded
Valuation	Assets	Entry Age	Liability	Ratio
Date	(a)	(b)	(b) - (a)	(a)/(b)
01-01-15	\$ 5,375,870	\$ 6,167,035	\$ 791,165	87.2%
01-01-17	5,469,220	7,358,544	1,889,324	74.3%
01-01-19	5,570,869	7,802,410	2,231,541	71.4%

BELLEVUE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION (UNAUDITED)

The comparability of trend information is affected by changes in actuarial assumptions, benefit provisions, actuarial funding methods, accounting policies, and other changes. Those changes usually affect trends in contribution requirements and in ratios that use the actuarial accrued liability as a factor.

Analysis of the dollar amount of the actuarial value of assets, actuarial accrued liability, and unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability in isolation can be misleading. Expressing the actuarial value of assets as a percentage of the actuarial accrued liability (Column 4) provides one indication of the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis. Analysis of this percentage, over time, indicates whether the system is becoming financially stronger or weaker. Generally, the greater this percentage, the stronger the plan.

BELLEVUE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION (UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF CONTRIBUTIONS

	Contributions			Contributions as
				a Percentage of
Actuarially	the Actuarially	Contribution	Covered-	Covered-
Determined	Determined	Deficiency	Employee	Employee
Contribution	Contributions	(Excess)	Payroll	Payroll
\$ 170,825	\$ 186,218	\$ (15,393)	\$ 1,106,820	16.82%
174,014	176,366	(2,352)	1,200,806	14.69%
176,162	176,162	-	1,230,987	14.31%
160,142	167,010	(6,868)	1,285,607	12.99%
174,538	192,605	(18,067)	1,473,902	13.07%
277,591	277,591	-	1,248,273	22.24%
278,926	278,926	-	1,265,193	22.05%
	\$ 170,825 174,014 176,162 160,142 174,538 277,591	Actuarially Determined Contribution \$ 170,825 \$ 186,218	In Relation to the Actuarially Determined Contribution	Actuarially Determined Contribution In Relation to the Actuarially Determined Contribution Contribution Contribution Covered-Employee Employee Payroll \$ 170,825 \$ 186,218 \$ (15,393) \$ 1,106,820 \$ 174,014 \$ 176,366 \$ (2,352) \$ 1,200,806 \$ 176,162 \$ 176,162 \$ 1,230,987 \$ 160,142 \$ 167,010 \$ (6,868) \$ 1,285,607 \$ 174,538 \$ 192,605 \$ (18,067) \$ 1,473,902 \$ 277,591 \$ 277,591 \$ 1,248,273

BELLEVUE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION NOTES TO SUPPLEMENTARY SCHEDULES (UNAUDITED)

The information presented in the supplementary schedules was determined as part of the actuarial valuation at the date indicated. Additional information as of the latest actuarial valuation date follows:

Actuaria1	valuation date	January	1.	2.0)1	()

Actuarial cost method Entry age normal

Amortization method Level dollar

Remaining amortization period 17 years

Asset valuation method Fair value

Actuarial assumptions:

Investment rate of return 7.5%

Projected salary increases * 4.5%

^{*} Includes inflation at 3.0%

BELLEVUE BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

The Honorable Tom W. Wolf

Governor Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

The Honorable Emily Marburger Mayor

> Mr. Valon C. Pennington Council President

> > **Ms. Cindy Bahn**Borough Manager

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at www.PaAuditor.gov. Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 229 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: news@PaAuditor.gov.