

COMPLIANCE AUDIT

Duboistown Borough Police Pension Plan Lycoming County, Pennsylvania For the Period January 1, 2016 to December 31, 2019

November 2020



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General

Eugene A. DePasquale • Auditor General



**Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General
Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018
Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General
Twitter: @PAAuditorGen
www.PaAuditor.gov**

**EUGENE A. DePASQUALE
AUDITOR GENERAL**

The Honorable Mayor and Borough Council
Duboistown Borough
Lycoming County
Duboistown, PA 17702

We have conducted a compliance audit of the Duboistown Borough Police Pension Plan for the period January 1, 2016 to December 31, 2019. We also evaluated compliance with some requirements subsequent to that period when possible. The audit was conducted pursuant to authority derived from the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act (Act 205 of 1984, as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.402(j)), which requires the Auditor General, as deemed necessary, to audit every municipality which receives general municipal pension system state aid and every municipal pension plan and fund in which general municipal pension system state aid is deposited. The audit was not conducted, nor was it required to be, in accordance with Government Auditing Standards issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. We planned and performed the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objective. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objective.

The objective of the audit was to determine if the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objective identified above. To determine whether the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, our methodology included the following:

- We determined whether state aid was properly determined and deposited in accordance with Act 205 requirements by verifying the annual deposit date of state aid and determining whether deposits were made within 30 days of receipt for all years within the period under audit.
- We determined whether annual employer contributions were calculated and deposited in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by examining the municipality's calculation of the plan's annual financial requirements and minimum municipal obligation (MMO) and comparing these calculated amounts to amounts actually budgeted and deposited into the pension plan as evidenced by supporting documentation.

- We determined whether annual employee contributions were calculated, deducted, and deposited into the pension plan in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by testing total members' contributions on an annual basis using the rates obtained from the plan's governing document in effect for all years within the period under audit and examining documents evidencing the deposit of these employee contributions into the pension plan.
- We determined whether retirement benefits calculated for the plan member who retired during the current audit period, represent payments to all (and only) those entitled to receive them and were properly determined and disbursed in accordance with the plan's governing document, applicable laws, and regulations by recalculating the amount of the monthly pension benefits due to the retired individual and comparing these amounts to supporting documentation evidencing amounts determined and actually paid to the recipient.
- We determined whether the January 1, 2015, and January 1, 2017 actuarial valuation reports were prepared and submitted by March 31, 2016, and 2018, respectively, in accordance with Act 205 and whether selected information provided on these reports is accurate, complete, and in accordance with plan provisions to ensure compliance for participation in the state aid program by comparing selected information to supporting source documentation. We determined that the January 1, 2019 actuarial valuation report was not prepared and submitted by March 31, 2020, as discussed further in Finding No. 2 below.

The Duboistown Borough Police Pension Plan participates in the Pennsylvania Municipal Retirement System (PMRS), which is an agent multiple-employer public employee retirement system that acts as a common investment and administrative agent for participating municipal pension plans. PMRS issues a separate Comprehensive Annual Financial Report, copies of which are available from the PMRS accounting office. PMRS's financial statements were not audited by us and, accordingly, we express no opinion or other form of assurance on them.

Borough officials are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the Duboistown Borough Police Pension Plan is administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies. As previously described, we tested transactions, interviewed selected officials and performed procedures to the extent necessary to provide reasonable assurance of detecting instances of noncompliance with legal and regulatory requirements or noncompliance with provisions of contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies that are significant within the context of the audit objective.

The results of our procedures indicated that, in all significant respects, the Duboistown Borough Police Pension Plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, except as noted in the following findings further discussed later in this report:

- Finding No. 1 – Failure To Deposit The Full Amount Of State Aid Into An Eligible Pension Plan
- Finding No. 2 – Failure To File Actuarial Valuation Report
- Finding No. 3 – Failure To Maintain An Adequate Record-Keeping System To Effectively Monitor Activity Of The Pension Plan

The accompanying supplementary information is presented for purposes of additional analysis. We did not audit the information or conclude on it and, accordingly, express no form of assurance on it.

The contents of this report were discussed with officials of Duboistown Borough and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report. We would like to thank borough officials for the cooperation extended to us during the conduct of the audit.

October 27, 2020



EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE
Auditor General

CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
Background.....	1
Findings and Recommendations:	
Finding No. 1 – Failure To Deposit The Full Amount Of State Aid Into An Eligible Pension Plan	2
Finding No. 2 – Failure to File Actuarial Valuation Report	3
Finding No. 3 – Failure To Maintain An Adequate Record-Keeping System To Effectively Monitor Activity Of The Pension Plan.....	4
Potential Withhold of State Aid.....	6
Supplementary Information	7
Report Distribution List	11

BACKGROUND

On December 18, 1984, the Pennsylvania Legislature adopted the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act (P.L. 1005, No. 205, as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.101 et seq.). The Act established mandatory actuarial reporting and funding requirements and a uniform basis for the distribution of state aid to Pennsylvania's public pension plans.

Annual state aid allocations are provided from a 2 percent foreign (out-of-state) casualty insurance premium tax, a portion of the foreign (out-of-state) fire insurance tax designated for paid firefighters and any investment income earned on the collection of these taxes. Generally, municipal pension plans established prior to December 18, 1984, are eligible for state aid. For municipal pension plans established after that date, the sponsoring municipality must fund the plan for three plan years before it becomes eligible for state aid. In accordance with Act 205, a municipality's annual state aid allocation cannot exceed its actual pension costs.

In addition to Act 205, the Duboistown Borough Police Pension Plan is also governed by implementing regulations published at Title 16, Part IV of the Pennsylvania Code and applicable provisions of various other state statutes including, but not limited to, the following:

Act 15 - Pennsylvania Municipal Retirement Law, Act of February 1, 1974
(P.L. 34, No. 15), as amended, 53 P.S. § 881.101 et seq.

The Duboistown Borough Police Pension Plan is a single-employer defined benefit pension plan locally controlled by the provisions of Ordinance No. 2002-2, as amended, and a separately executed plan agreement with the Pennsylvania Municipal Retirement System, adopted pursuant to Act 15. The plan is also affected by the provisions of collective bargaining agreements between the borough and its police officers. The plan was established April 25, 1974. Active members are not required to contribute to the plan. Active members are not required to contribute to the plan. As of December 31, 2019, the plan had no active members and two retirees receiving pension benefits.

DUBOISTOWN BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Finding No. 1 – Failure To Deposit The Full Amount Of State Aid Into An Eligible Pension Plan

Condition: The municipality did not deposit the full amount of its 2018 state aid allocation into an eligible pension plan in accordance with Act 205. The municipality received its 2018 state aid allocation in the amount of \$15,752 on September 20, 2018, but, as of the date of this report, only state aid totaling \$5,057 was deposited into its pension plans.

Criteria: Section 402(g) of Act 205 states, in part:

. . . the total amount of the general municipal pension system State aid received by the municipality shall, within 30 days of receipt by the treasurer of the municipality, be deposited in the pension fund or the alternate funding mechanism applicable to the respective pension plan.

Cause: The full amount of the 2018 state aid was not deposited into an eligible pension plan due to a recent turnover in officials responsible for administration of the pension plan. Current plan officials were unaware of applicable Act 205 provisions and the borough lacked adequate internal control procedures to ensure the timely deposit of the full amount of state aid received by the borough during 2018 into its pension plans in accordance with the act.

Effect: When state aid is not deposited into a pension plan account, the funds are not available to pay operating expenses or for investment and the risk of misapplication is increased.

Recommendation: We recommend that the municipality deposit the borough's outstanding 2018 state aid allocation amounting to \$10,695, plus interest earned during the period beyond the 30-day grace period allowed by Act 205, compounded annually, into its pension plans. A copy of the interest calculation must be maintained by the borough for examination during our next audit of the plan.

We also recommend that plan officials develop and implement procedures to ensure that future state aid is deposited into the borough's pension plans within 30 days of receipt by the municipal treasurer.

Management's Response: Municipal officials agreed with the finding without exception.

Auditor's Conclusion: Compliance will be evaluated during our next audit of the plan.

DUBOISTOWN BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Finding No. 2 – Failure to File Actuarial Valuation Report

Condition: The actuarial valuation report for the borough’s defined benefit police pension plan with a valuation date of January 1, 2019, was not prepared and submitted to the Municipal Pension Reporting Program (MPRP) (*formerly the Public Employee Retirement Commission*) by the March 31, 2020, deadline, as required by Act 205 and remains delinquent as of the date of this report.

Criteria: Section 201(a) of Act 205 states, in part:

Each municipality which has established or maintains a pension plan for its employees, including any municipality which participates in the Pennsylvania Municipal Retirement System, shall cause to be made actuarial valuation reports. Actuarial valuation reports shall be made biennially, unless the applicable municipality is applying or has previously applied for supplemental State assistance pursuant to Section 603, whereupon actuarial valuation reports shall be made annually.

Furthermore, Section 201(b) of Act 205 states, in part:

The biennial actuarial valuation report required pursuant to subsection (a) shall be made as of the beginning of each plan year occurring in an odd-numbered calendar year and shall be filed with the executive director of the commission no later than the last business day of March occurring in the following calendar year.

204 of Act 205 provides:

If a complete actuarial valuation report or experience investigation is not filed in a timely fashion, any and all financing which is provided to the municipality by the Commonwealth and is dedicated for pension plan purposes shall be withheld until the report or investigation is filed.

Cause: Due to recent turnover in officials responsible for administration of the pension plan, the failure to file the actuarial valuation report for the police pension plan occurred because this was the first time that current plan officials were responsible for the preparation and submission of this report and were unfamiliar with the information required to complete the report and the applicable Act 205 filing deadlines.

DUBOISTOWN BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Finding No. 2 – (Continued)

Effect: Due to the late filing of the actuarial valuation report for the non-uniformed pension plan (*as disclosed in the non-uniformed pension plan report*) and the failure to file the police pension plan actuarial valuation report, the municipality's 2020 state aid will be withheld until the necessary report is filed. Consequently, the municipality does not have its state aid available to use for operating expenses and investment opportunities. In addition, future state aid, if any, will be withheld until the outstanding report is filed with the MPRP. Moreover, the borough may receive less state aid than it would have received had the reports been filed in a timely manner.

Recommendation: We recommend that the municipality take immediate action to complete the January 1, 2019 Act 205 actuarial valuation report for the police pension plan, which was due March 31, 2020, and submit the report to the MPRP, accordingly. By submitting the report as soon as possible, the municipality can minimize the length of time the pension aid will be withheld due to the delinquent filing of the required report.

Furthermore, to insure that future actuarial filing deadlines are met and to improve pension plan administration, we recommend that plan officials develop and implement internal control procedures, such as a calendar listing the various reporting and filing deadlines required by Act 205, including the actuarial valuation report filing date.

Management's Response: Municipal officials agreed with the finding without exception.

Auditor's Conclusion: Compliance will be evaluated during our next audit of the plan.

Finding No. 3 – Failure To Maintain An Adequate Record-Keeping System To Effectively Monitor Activity Of The Pension Plan

Condition: The borough's record-keeping system did not provide effective control over the transactional activity of the police pension plan during 2019. Municipal officials were unable to furnish annual financial statements or custodial account transaction statements for the police pension plan. These annual financial and account statements have historically been provided by the plan's custodian, PMRS. However, as of the date of this report, annual financial and accounting statements summarizing the pension account activity have not been provided for the year 2019.

DUBOISTOWN BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Finding No. 3 – (Continued)

Criteria: An adequate system of accounting and record keeping is a prerequisite for sound administration of pension plans. In addition, assets held in a custodial account for the purpose of plan management are to be governed by the terms and provisions of the account contract, provided that the terms and provisions of the contract are within the parameters of all prevailing pension legislation. Although the municipality may contract with a trustee to administer the financial management of the plan, the fiduciary responsibility for the plan remains with the municipality.

Cause: Municipal officials indicated that the plan’s custodian, PMRS, failed to provide copies of the custodial account transaction statements summarizing activity of the pension plan account for the year 2019. In addition, municipal officials did not maintain a separate detailed accounting of pension plan transactions, which, among other things, helps assure the production of proper financial statements to effectively monitor the annual activity of the pension plan.

Effect: Although we were able to obtain alternate documentation from the municipality to evidence the propriety of the individual transactions tested during performance of the audit for the year 2019, the failure to maintain annual financial and/or account transaction statements prohibits municipal officials from effectively monitoring the plan’s financial operations. Additionally, inadequate monitoring of the pension plan account could lead to undetected errors or improprieties in account transactions as well as deficiencies in authorizing and implementing pension plan policies and procedures.

Recommendation: We recommend that municipal officials contact the plan custodian and obtain annual financial statements of the custodial account of the police pension plan for the year 2019 to ensure the accuracy and propriety of the transaction activity. In addition, we recommend that municipal officials establish and maintain a financial record-keeping system that allows the municipality to effectively monitor the plan’s financial operations, even in the absence of statements from the plan custodian. Municipal officials should refer to the Auditor General’s Bulletin No. 2-88 entitled “Preparation, Maintenance and Auditability of Financial Records,” for further guidance in establishing adequate accounting and record-keeping procedures.

Management’s Response: Municipal officials agreed with the finding without exception.

Auditor’s Conclusion: PMRS has indicated that they are in the process of preparing 2019 Year-End Financial Activity Reports and Annual Member Statements for all municipalities. PMRS has also indicated that they recently went through a substantial upgrade to the plan administration software and implemented a new accounting system. This transition in addition to disruptions in normal government operation due to COVID-19 has resulted in a three to four month delay in the 2019 year-end reporting process. Compliance with the finding recommendation will be evaluated during our next audit of the plan.

DUBOISTOWN BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
POTENTIAL WITHHOLD OF STATE AID

Conditions such as those reported Findings No. 1 and No. 2 contained in this audit report may lead to a total withholding of state aid in the future unless those findings are corrected. However, such action will not be considered if sufficient written documentation is provided to verify compliance with this department's recommendation. Such documentation should be submitted to: Department of the Auditor General, Bureau of Municipal Pension & Liquor Control Audits, 314 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120.

DUBOISTOWN BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
 (UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF FUNDING PROGRESS

Historical trend information about the plan is presented herewith as supplementary information. It is intended to help users assess the plan’s funding status on a going-concern basis, assess progress made in accumulating assets to pay benefits when due, and make comparisons with other state and local government retirement systems.

The actuarial information is required by Act 205 biennially. The historical information, beginning as of January 1, 2013, is as follows:

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Actuarial Valuation Date	Actuarial Value of Assets (a)	Actuarial Accrued Liability (AAL) - Entry Age (b)	Unfunded (Assets in Excess of) Actuarial Accrued Liability (b) - (a)	Funded Ratio (a)/(b)
01-01-13	\$ 390,904	\$ 417,593	\$ 26,689	93.6%
01-01-15	416,349	303,260	(113,089)	137.3%
01-01-17	448,756	470,586	21,830	95.4%

The Department typically presents this data as of the plan’s actuarial valuation dates for the past most recent six consecutive fiscal years. However, since the 2019 actuarial information was not submitted as disclosed in Finding No. 2, information was not available for the January 1, 2019 valuation period.

DUBOISTOWN BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

The comparability of trend information is affected by changes in actuarial assumptions, benefit provisions, actuarial funding methods, accounting policies, and other changes. Those changes usually affect trends in contribution requirements and in ratios that use the actuarial accrued liability as a factor.

Analysis of the dollar amount of the actuarial value of assets, actuarial accrued liability, and unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability in isolation can be misleading. Expressing the actuarial value of assets as a percentage of the actuarial accrued liability (Column 4) provides one indication of the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis. Analysis of this percentage, over time, indicates whether the system is becoming financially stronger or weaker. Generally, the greater this percentage, the stronger the plan.

DUBOISTOWN BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
 (UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF CONTRIBUTIONS

<u>Year Ended December 31</u>	<u>Actuarially Determined Contribution</u>	<u>Actual Contributions</u>	<u>Contribution Deficiency (Excess)</u>	<u>Covered- Employee Payroll*</u>	<u>Contributions as a Percentage of Covered- Employee Payroll</u>
2014	\$ 13,786	\$ 13,786	\$ -	\$ 47,567	28.98%
2015	7,325	7,345	(20)	18,507	39.69%
2016	14,979	14,979	-	37,779	39.65%
2017	-	-	-	38,501	0.00%
2018	-	-	-	39,367	0.00%
2019	11,729	11,729	-		

* Due to the timing of this audit, covered-employee payroll for 2019 was not provided in this schedule.

DUBOISTOWN BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
 NOTES TO SUPPLEMENTARY SCHEDULES
 (UNAUDITED)

The information presented in the supplementary schedules was determined as part of the actuarial valuation at the date indicated. Additional information as of the latest actuarial valuation date follows:

Actuarial valuation date	January 1, 2019
Actuarial cost method	Entry age normal
Amortization method	Level dollar for plan bases and an average for Aggregate Gain/Loss, 10% of surplus is credited against aggregate cost where applicable.
Remaining amortization period	None.
Asset valuation method	The Actuarial Value of Assets equal the sum of all audited reserve funds as of the valuation date, including Member, Municipal, Retired, Disability, and DROP Reserves, when applicable, and a one year administration expense reserve, plus the portion of any additional investment income to be distributed as excess interest, based on PMRS Policy Statement 05-2. This asset valuation is based on the unique legislative structure of PMRS and the administrative rules adopted by the PMRS Board in conjunction with Pennsylvania Municipal Retirement Law. ¹

Actuarial assumptions:

Investment rate of return *	5.25%, compounded annually, net of investment and administration expenses.
Projected salary increases *	2.8%-7.05%
* Includes inflation at	2.8%
Cost-of-living adjustments	2.8% per year, subject to plan limitations.

¹ The administrative rules adopted by the PMRS Board, which are not subject to comply with Actuarial Standards of Practice (ASOP), when defining the Actuarial Value of Assets (AVA), does not necessarily meet the requirement of ASOP 44 Selection and Use of Asset Valuation Methods for Pension Valuations. The AVA provided within this report follow the Pennsylvania Municipal Retirement Law and the PMRS policy statement.

DUBOISTOWN BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

The Honorable Tom W. Wolf
Governor
Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

The Honorable Norman Cowden
Mayor

Mr. Michael Rogers
Council President

Ms. Ann Marie Baker
Borough Manager

Ms. Charity Rosenberry, CPA
Pennsylvania Municipal Retirement System

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at www.PaAuditor.gov. Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 229 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: news@PaAuditor.gov.