

COMPLIANCE AUDIT

East Goshen Township Firemen's Pension Plan Chester County, Pennsylvania For the Period January 1, 2014 to December 31, 2017

June 2018



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General

Eugene A. DePasquale • Auditor General



**Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General
Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018
Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General
Twitter: @PAAuditorGen
www.PaAuditor.gov**

**EUGENE A. DePASQUALE
AUDITOR GENERAL**

Board of Township Supervisors
East Goshen Township
Chester County
West Chester, PA 19380

We have conducted a compliance audit of the East Goshen Township Firemen's Pension Plan for the period January 1, 2014 to December 31, 2017. We also evaluated compliance with some requirements subsequent to that period when possible. The audit was conducted pursuant to authority derived from Section 402(j) of Act 205 and in accordance with the standards applicable to performance audits contained in *Government Auditing Standards* issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our conclusions based on our audit objective. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our conclusions based on our audit objective.

The objective of the audit was to determine if the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objective identified above. To determine whether the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, our methodology included the following:

- We determined whether state aid was properly determined and deposited in accordance with Act 205 requirements by verifying the annual deposit date of state aid and determining whether deposits were made within 30 days of receipt for all years within the period under audit.
- We determined whether annual employer contributions were calculated and deposited in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by examining the municipality's calculation of the plan's annual financial requirements and minimum municipal obligation (MMO) and comparing these calculated amounts to amounts actually budgeted and deposited into the pension plan as evidenced by supporting documentation.

- We determined whether annual employee contributions were calculated, deducted, and deposited into the pension plan in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by testing total members' contributions on an annual basis using the rates obtained from the plan's governing document in effect for all years within the period under audit and examining documents evidencing the deposit of these employee contributions into the pension plan.
- We determined whether retirement benefits calculated for the plan member who retired during the current audit period represent payments to all (and only) those entitled to receive them and were properly determined and disbursed in accordance with the plan's governing document, applicable laws and regulations by recalculating the amount of the monthly pension benefit due to the retired individual and comparing these amounts to supporting documentation evidencing amounts determined and actually paid to the recipient.
- We determined whether the January 1, 2013, January 1, 2015 and January 1, 2017 actuarial valuation reports were prepared and submitted to the former Public Employee Retirement Commission (PERC) by March 31, 2014, 2016 and 2018, respectively, in accordance with Act 205 and whether selected information provided on these reports is accurate, complete, and in accordance with plan provisions to ensure compliance for participation in the state aid program by comparing selected information to supporting source documentation.

East Goshen Township contracted with an independent certified public accounting firm for annual audits of its basic financial statements for the years ending December 31, 2016, 2015, and 2014 which are available at the township's offices. Those financial statements were not audited by us and, accordingly, we express no opinion or other form of assurance on them.

Township officials are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the East Goshen Township Firemen's Pension Plan is administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies. In conducting our audit, we obtained an understanding of the township's internal controls as they relate to the township's compliance with those requirements and that we considered to be significant within the context of our audit objective, and assessed whether those significant controls were properly designed and implemented. Additionally and as previously described, we tested transactions, assessed official actions, performed analytical procedures, and interviewed selected officials to provide reasonable assurance of detecting instances of noncompliance with legal and regulatory requirements or noncompliance with provisions of contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies that are significant within the context of the audit objective.

The results of our procedures indicated that, in all significant respects, the East Goshen Township Firemen's Pension Plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

The accompanying supplementary information is presented for purposes of additional analysis. We did not audit the information or conclude on it and, accordingly, express no form of assurance on it.

The contents of this report were discussed with officials of East Goshen Township and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report. We would like to thank township officials for the cooperation extended to us during the conduct of the audit.

June 12, 2018

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Eugene A. DePasquale", with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE
Auditor General

CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
Background.....	1
Supplementary Information	3
Report Distribution List	9

BACKGROUND

On December 18, 1984, the Pennsylvania Legislature adopted the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act (P.L. 1005, No. 205, as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.101 et seq.). The Act established mandatory actuarial reporting and funding requirements and a uniform basis for the distribution of state aid to Pennsylvania's public pension plans. Section 402(j) of Act 205 specifically requires the Auditor General, as deemed necessary, to make an audit of every municipality which receives general municipal pension system state aid and of every municipal pension plan and fund in which general municipal pension system state aid is deposited.

Annual state aid allocations are provided from a 2 percent foreign (out-of-state) casualty insurance premium tax, a portion of the foreign (out-of-state) fire insurance tax designated for paid firefighters and any investment income earned on the collection of these taxes. Generally, municipal pension plans established prior to December 18, 1984, are eligible for state aid. For municipal pension plans established after that date, the sponsoring municipality must fund the plan for three plan years before it becomes eligible for state aid. In accordance with Act 205, a municipality's annual state aid allocation cannot exceed its actual pension costs.

In addition to Act 205, the East Goshen Township Firemen's Pension Plan is also governed by implementing regulations adopted by the former Public Employee Retirement Commission published at Title 16, Part IV of the Pennsylvania Code and applicable provisions of various other state statutes.

The East Goshen Township Firemen's Pension Plan is a single-employer defined benefit pension plan locally controlled by the provisions of Ordinance No. 78, as amended. The plan is also affected by the provisions of collective bargaining agreements between the township and its firefighters. The plan was established January 1, 1987. Active members are required to contribute 2.25 percent of compensation to the plan. As of December 31, 2017, the plan had 8 active members, 1 terminated member eligible for vested benefits in the future, and 2 retirees receiving pension benefits from the plan.

BACKGROUND – (Continued)

As of December 31, 2017, selected plan benefit provisions are as follows:

Eligibility Requirements:

Normal Retirement	Later of age 55 or 5 years of service, whichever occurs later.
Early Retirement	Age 52
Vesting	Full vesting after 5 years of service.

Retirement Benefit:

A monthly benefit equal to 1.25% of final 60 months average salary multiplied by years and completed months of service.

Survivor Benefit:

Before Retirement Eligibility	Refund of member contributions plus interest.
After Retirement Eligibility	A monthly benefit equal to 50% of the pension the member was receiving or was entitled to receive on the day of the member's death.

Service Related Disability Benefit:

A monthly benefit equal to 50% of the member's final average salary starting 90 days after the disability occurred.

EAST GOSHEN TOWNSHIP FIREMEN'S PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

The supplementary information contained on Pages 3 and 4 reflects the implementation of GASB Statement No. 67, *Financial Reporting for Pension Plans*. The objective of this statement is to improve financial reporting by state and local governmental pension plans.

SCHEDULE OF CHANGES IN THE NET PENSION
LIABILITY AND RELATED RATIOS
FOR THE YEARS ENDED DECEMBER 31, 2014, 2015, 2016, AND 2017

	2014	2015	2016	2017
Total Pension Liability				
Service cost	\$ 49,337	\$ 50,055	\$ 52,558	\$ 54,854
Interest	72,308	75,948	83,697	90,803
Difference between expected and actual experience	-	(79,060)	-	(22,361)
Changes of assumptions	-	20,953	-	3,143
Benefit payments, including refunds of member contributions	(6,727)	(17,807)	(17,807)	(17,807)
Net Change in Total Pension Liability	114,918	50,089	118,448	108,632
Total Pension Liability – Beginning	987,005	1,101,923	1,152,012	1,270,460
Total Pension Liability - Ending (a)	<u>\$ 1,101,923</u>	<u>\$ 1,152,012</u>	<u>\$1,270,460</u>	<u>\$1,379,092</u>
Plan Fiduciary Net Position				
Contributions – State Aid	\$ 64,957	\$ 63,013	\$ 79,410	\$ 72,764
Contributions – Member	10,984	10,858	11,281	12,697
Net investment income	37,095	(23,146)	72,041	197,512
Benefit payments, including refunds of member contributions	(6,727)	(17,807)	(17,807)	(17,807)
Administrative expense	(2,975)	(6,600)	(4,300)	(7,500)
Net Change in Plan Fiduciary Net Position	103,334	26,318	140,625	257,666
Plan Fiduciary Net Position – Beginning	985,962	1,089,296	1,115,614	1,256,239
Plan Fiduciary Net Position - Ending (b)	<u>\$ 1,089,296</u>	<u>\$ 1,115,614</u>	<u>\$1,256,239</u>	<u>\$1,513,905</u>
Net Pension Liability - Ending (a-b)	<u>\$ 12,627</u>	<u>\$ 36,398</u>	<u>\$ 14,221</u>	<u>\$ (134,813)</u>
Plan Fiduciary Net Position as a Percentage of the Total Pension Liability	98.9%	96.8%	98.9%	109.8%
Estimated Covered Employee Payroll	\$ 587,288	\$ 555,812	\$ 570,000	\$ 700,000
Net Pension Liability as a Percentage of Covered Employee Payroll	2.2%	6.5%	2.5%	(19.3%)

EAST GOSHEN TOWNSHIP FIREMEN'S PENSION PLAN
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
 (UNAUDITED)

Sensitivity of the Net Pension Liability to Changes in the Discount Rate

The following presents the net pension liability of the township as of December 31, 2014, 2015, 2016 and 2017, calculated using the discount rate of 7.0%, as well as what the township's net pension liability would be if it were calculated using a discount rate that is 1 percentage-point lower or 1 percentage-point higher than the current rate:

	1% Decrease (6.0%)	Current Discount Rate (7.0%)	1% Increase (8.0%)
Net Pension Liability - 12/31/14	\$ 169,547	\$ 12,627	\$ (118,980)
Net Pension Liability – 12/31/15	\$ 208,157	\$ 36,398	\$ (106,501)
Net Pension Liability – 12/31/16	\$ 199,113	\$ 14,221	\$ (139,889)
Net Pension Liability - 12/31/17	\$ 61,265	\$ (134,813)	\$ (298,398)

SCHEDULE OF INVESTMENT RETURNS

Annual Money-Weighted Rate of Return, Net of Investment Expense:

2017	15.67%
2016	6.46%
2015	(2.16%)
2014	2.50%

EAST GOSHEN TOWNSHIP FIREMEN'S PENSION PLAN
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
 (UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF FUNDING PROGRESS

Historical trend information about the plan is presented herewith as supplementary information. It is intended to help users assess the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis, assess progress made in accumulating assets to pay benefits when due, and make comparisons with other state and local government retirement systems.

The actuarial information is required by Act 205 biennially. The historical information, beginning as of January 1, 2013, is as follows:

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Actuarial Valuation Date	Actuarial Value of Assets (a)	Actuarial Accrued Liability (AAL) - Entry Age (b)	Unfunded (Assets in Excess of) Actuarial Accrued Liability (b) - (a)	Funded Ratio (a)/(b)
01-01-13	\$ 801,227	\$ 878,625	\$ 77,398	91.2%
01-01-15	1,089,296	1,043,816	(45,480)	104.4%
01-01-17	1,256,239	1,251,242	(4,997)	100.4%

EAST GOSHEN TOWNSHIP FIREMEN'S PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

The comparability of trend information is affected by changes in actuarial assumptions, benefit provisions, actuarial funding methods, accounting policies, and other changes. Those changes usually affect trends in contribution requirements and in ratios that use the actuarial accrued liability as a factor.

Analysis of the dollar amount of the actuarial value of assets, actuarial accrued liability, and unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability in isolation can be misleading. Expressing the actuarial value of assets as a percentage of the actuarial accrued liability (Column 4) provides one indication of the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis. Analysis of this percentage, over time, indicates whether the system is becoming financially stronger or weaker. Generally, the greater this percentage, the stronger the plan.

EAST GOSHEN TOWNSHIP FIREMEN'S PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF CONTRIBUTIONS FROM EMPLOYER
AND OTHER CONTRIBUTING ENTITIES

Year Ended December 31	Annual Required Contribution	Percentage Contributed
2012	\$ 51,412	106.7%
2013	55,396	104.3%
2014	55,591	116.8%
2015	53,364	118.1%
2016	48,617	163.3%
2017	59,720	121.8%

EAST GOSHEN TOWNSHIP FIREMEN'S PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
NOTES TO SUPPLEMENTARY SCHEDULES
(UNAUDITED)

The information presented in the supplementary schedules was determined as part of the actuarial valuation at the date indicated. Additional information as of the latest actuarial valuation date follows:

Actuarial valuation date	January 1, 2017
Actuarial cost method	Entry age normal
Amortization method	N/A
Remaining amortization period	N/A
Asset valuation method	Fair value
Actuarial assumptions:	
Investment rate of return	7.0%
Projected salary increases	5.0%
Cost-of-living adjustments	None assumed

EAST GOSHEN TOWNSHIP FIREMEN'S PENSION PLAN
REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

The Honorable Tom W. Wolf
Governor
Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

Mr. E. Martin Shane
Chairman, Board of Township Supervisors

Mr. Carmen Battavio
Vice-Chairman, Board of Township Supervisors

Ms. Janet Emanuel
Township Supervisor

Mr. Michael Lynch
Township Supervisor

Mr. David Shuey
Township Supervisor

Mr. Louis Smith
Township Manager

Ms. Joanne Morgan
Secretary

Mr. John Altshul
Finance Director

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at www.PaAuditor.gov. Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 229 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: news@PaAuditor.gov.