

COMPLIANCE AUDIT

Washington Township Non-Uniformed Pension Plan Erie County, Pennsylvania For the Period January 1, 2016 to December 31, 2019

November 2020



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General

Eugene A. DePasquale • Auditor General



**Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General
Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018
Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General
Twitter: @PAAuditorGen
www.PaAuditor.gov**

**EUGENE A. DePASQUALE
AUDITOR GENERAL**

The Honorable Mayor and Township Council
Washington Township
Erie County
Edinboro, PA 16412

We have conducted a compliance audit of the Washington Township Non-Uniformed Pension Plan for the period January 1, 2016 to December 31, 2019. We also evaluated compliance with some requirements subsequent to that period when possible. The audit was conducted pursuant to authority derived from the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act (Act 205 of 1984, as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.402(j)), which requires the Auditor General, as deemed necessary, to audit every municipality which receives general municipal pension system state aid and every municipal pension plan and fund in which general municipal pension system state aid is deposited. The audit was not conducted, nor was it required to be, in accordance with Government Auditing Standards issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. We planned and performed the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives.

The objectives of the audit were:

1. To determine if municipal officials took appropriate corrective action to address the finding contained in our prior report; and
2. To determine if the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objectives identified above. To determine if municipal officials took appropriate corrective action to address the finding contained in our prior report, we inquired of plan officials and evaluated supporting documentation provided by officials evidencing that the suggested corrective action has been appropriately taken. To determine whether the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, our methodology included the following:

- We determined whether state aid was properly determined and deposited in accordance with Act 205 requirements by verifying the annual deposit date of state aid and determining whether deposits were made within 30 days of receipt for all years within the period under audit.
- We determined whether annual employer contributions were calculated and deposited in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by examining the municipality's calculation of the plan's annual financial requirements and minimum municipal obligation (MMO) and comparing these calculated amounts to amounts actually budgeted and deposited into the pension plan as evidenced by supporting documentation.
- We determined that there were no employee contributions required by the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations for the years covered by our audit period.
- We determined that there were no benefit calculations prepared for the years covered by our audit period.
- We determined whether the January 1, 2015, January 1, 2017, and January 1, 2019 actuarial valuation reports were prepared and submitted by March 31, 2016, 2018, and 2020, respectively, in accordance with Act 205 and whether selected information provided on these reports is accurate, complete, and in accordance with plan provisions to ensure compliance for participation in the state aid program by comparing selected information to supporting source documentation.

The Washington Township Non-Uniformed Pension Plan participates in the Pennsylvania Municipal Retirement System (PMRS), which is an agent multiple-employer public employee retirement system that acts as a common investment and administrative agent for participating municipal pension plans. PMRS issues a separate Comprehensive Annual Financial Report, copies of which are available from the PMRS accounting office. PMRS's financial statements were not audited by us and, accordingly, we express no opinion or other form of assurance on them.

Township officials are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the Washington Township Non-Uniformed Pension Plan is administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies. As previously described, we tested transactions, interviewed selected officials, and performed procedures to the extent necessary to provide reasonable assurance of detecting instances of noncompliance with legal and regulatory requirements or noncompliance with provisions of contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies that are significant within the context of the audit objectives.

The results of our procedures indicated that, in all significant respects, the Washington Township Non-Uniformed Pension Plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, except as noted in the following findings further discussed later in this report:

Finding No. 1 – Receipt Of State Aid In Excess Of Entitlement

Finding No. 2 – Failure To Maintain An Adequate Record-Keeping System To Effectively Monitor Activity Of The Pension Plan

The accompanying supplementary information is presented for purposes of additional analysis. We did not audit the information or conclude on it and, accordingly, express no form of assurance on it.

The contents of this report were discussed with officials of Washington Township and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report. We would like to thank township officials for the cooperation extended to us during the conduct of the audit.

October 7, 2020



EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE
Auditor General

CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
Background.....	1
Status of Prior Finding.....	2
Findings and Recommendations:	
Finding No. 1 – Receipt Of State Aid In Excess Of Entitlement.....	3
Finding No. 2 – Failure To Maintain An Adequate Record-Keeping System To Effectively Monitor Activity Of The Pension Plan	5
Potential Withhold of State Aid.....	7
Supplementary Information	8
Report Distribution List	9

BACKGROUND

On December 18, 1984, the Pennsylvania Legislature adopted the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act (P.L. 1005, No. 205, as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.101 et seq.). The Act established mandatory actuarial reporting and funding requirements and a uniform basis for the distribution of state aid to Pennsylvania's public pension plans.

Annual state aid allocations are provided from a 2 percent foreign (out-of-state) casualty insurance premium tax, a portion of the foreign (out-of-state) fire insurance tax designated for paid firefighters and any investment income earned on the collection of these taxes. Generally, municipal pension plans established prior to December 18, 1984, are eligible for state aid. For municipal pension plans established after that date, the sponsoring municipality must fund the plan for three plan years before it becomes eligible for state aid. In accordance with Act 205, a municipality's annual state aid allocation cannot exceed its actual pension costs.

In addition to Act 205, the Washington Township Non-Uniformed Pension Plan is also governed by implementing regulations published at Title 16, Part IV of the Pennsylvania Code and applicable provisions of various other state statutes including, but not limited to, the following:

Act 15 - Pennsylvania Municipal Retirement Law, Act of February 1, 1974
(P.L. 34, No. 15), as amended, 53 P.S. § 881.101 et seq.

The Washington Township Non-Uniformed Pension Plan is a single-employer cash balance pension plan locally controlled by the provisions of Ordinance No. 2-06, and a separately executed plan agreement with the plan custodian, adopted pursuant to Act 15. The plan was established January 1, 1986. Active members are not required to contribute to the plan. The municipality is required to contribute 7 percent of compensation. As of December 31, 2019, the plan had 11 active members, 3 terminated members eligible for vested benefits in the future, and 8 retirees receiving pension benefits.

WASHINGTON TOWNSHIP NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
STATUS OF PRIOR FINDING

Compliance With Prior Recommendation

Washington Township has complied with the prior recommendation concerning the following:

- Incorrect Data On Certification Form AG 385 Resulting In An Underpayment Of State Aid

During the current audit period, municipal officials accurately reported the required pension data on the Certification Forms AG 385.

WASHINGTON TOWNSHIP NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Finding No. 1 – Receipt Of State Aid In Excess Of Entitlement

Condition: The township received state aid in excess of the non-uniformed pension plan’s pension costs in the years 2016, 2017 and 2019, as illustrated below:

	<u>2016</u>	<u>2017</u>	<u>2019</u>
Actual municipal pension costs <i>(full-time employees)</i>	\$ 35,416	\$ 36,416	\$ 38,757
Forfeitures available	<u>(21,331)</u>	<u>(13,089)</u>	<u>(2,321)</u>
Adjusted actual municipal pension costs <i>(full-time employees)</i>	\$ 14,085	\$ 23,327	\$ 36,436
State aid received	<u>(29,625)</u>	<u>(31,893)</u>	<u>(37,679)</u>
Excess state aid	<u>\$ 15,540</u>	<u>\$ 8,566</u>	<u>\$ 1,243</u>

The excess state aid remains in the township’s general fund as of the date of this report.

Criteria: Section 402(f)(2) of Act 205 states:

No municipality shall be entitled to receive an allocation of general municipal pension system State aid in an amount which exceeds the aggregate actual financial requirements of any municipal pension plans for police officers, paid firefighters or employees other than police officers or paid firefighters maintained by the municipality, less the amount of any aggregate annual member or employee contributions during the next succeeding plan year, as reported in the most recent complete actuarial report filed with the commission.

In addition, Section 14 of the plan agreement states:

In the event a member’s service with the Township is terminated for any reason whatsoever before the funds set aside for such member are vested or if the member elects not to receive a benefit, then the amount of such funds which have not been contributed by the member and which are not vested shall be credited against the next contribution due from the Township for the remaining or future members of this Plan.

WASHINGTON TOWNSHIP NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Finding No. 1 – (Continued)

Cause: Plan officials failed to establish adequate internal control procedures to reconcile the township's state aid allocation, along with available employee forfeitures, with the plan's annual pension costs.

Effect: It is this department's opinion that because the entire proceeds of the insurance premium tax on foreign casualty insurance companies are distributed annually to each eligible recipient municipality, it is inappropriate to use state aid in one year to offset pension costs in other years. Consequently, the overpayment of state aid in the years 2016, 2017, and 2019 must be returned to the Commonwealth for redistribution.

Furthermore, the township's future state aid allocations may be withheld until the finding recommendation is complied with.

Recommendation: We recommend that the municipality return the \$25,349 of excess state aid received in the years 2016, 2017, and 2019 to the Commonwealth, from the township's general fund. A check in this amount, with interest compounded annually from date of receipt to date of repayment, at a rate earned by the plan, should be made payable to: Commonwealth of Pennsylvania and mailed to: Department of the Auditor General, Municipal Pension & Fire Relief Programs Unit, 321 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120. A copy of the interest calculation must be submitted along with evidence of payment.

Furthermore, we recommend that, in the future, plan officials reconcile the township's annual state aid allocation, along with any available plan forfeitures, with the plan's annual pension costs and reimburse any excess state aid received to the Commonwealth.

Management's Response: Municipal officials agreed with the finding without exception.

Auditor's Conclusion: Due to the potential withhold of state aid, the township's compliance with the finding recommendation will be monitored subsequent to the release of the audit report and through our next audit of the plan.

WASHINGTON TOWNSHIP NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Finding No. 2 – Failure To Maintain An Adequate Record-Keeping System To Effectively Monitor Activity Of The Pension Plan

Condition: The township’s record-keeping system did not provide effective control over the transactional activity of the non-uniformed pension plan during 2019. Municipal officials were unable to furnish annual financial statements or custodial account transaction statements for the non-uniformed pension plan. These annual financial and account statements have historically been provided by the plan’s custodian, PMRS. However, as of the date of this report, annual financial and accounting statements summarizing the pension account activity have not been provided for the year 2019.

Criteria: An adequate system of accounting and record keeping is a prerequisite for sound administration of pension plans. In addition, assets held in a custodial account for the purpose of plan management are to be governed by the terms and provisions of the account contract, provided that the terms and provisions of the contract are within the parameters of all prevailing pension legislation. Although the municipality may contract with a trustee to administer the financial management of the plan, the fiduciary responsibility for the plan remains with the municipality.

Cause: Municipal officials indicated that the plan’s custodian, PMRS, failed to provide copies of the custodial account transaction statements summarizing activity of the pension plan account for the year 2019. In addition, municipal officials did not maintain a separate detailed accounting of pension plan transactions which, among other things, helps assure the production of proper financial statements to effectively monitor the annual activity of the pension plan.

Effect: Although we were able to obtain alternate documentation from the municipality to evidence the propriety of the individual transactions tested during performance of the audit for the year 2019, the failure to maintain annual financial and/or account transaction statements prohibits municipal officials from effectively monitoring the plan’s financial operations. Additionally, inadequate monitoring of the pension plan account could lead to undetected errors or improprieties in account transactions as well as deficiencies in authorizing and implementing pension plan policies and procedures.

Recommendation: We recommend that municipal officials contact the plan custodian and obtain annual financial statements of the custodial account of the non-uniformed pension plan for the year 2019 to ensure the accuracy and propriety of the transaction activity. In addition, we recommend that municipal officials establish and maintain a financial record-keeping system that allows the municipality to effectively monitor the plan’s financial operations, even in the absence of statements from the plan custodian. Municipal officials should refer to the Auditor General’s Bulletin No. 2-88 entitled “Preparation, Maintenance and Auditability of Financial Records,” for further guidance in establishing adequate accounting and record-keeping procedures.

WASHINGTON TOWNSHIP NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Finding No. 2 – (Continued)

Management's Response: Municipal officials agreed with the finding without exception.

Auditor's Conclusion: PMRS has indicated that they are in the process of preparing 2019 Year-End Financial Activity Reports and Annual Member Statements for all municipalities. PMRS has also indicated that they recently went through a substantial upgrade to the plan administration software and implemented a new accounting system. This transition in addition to disruptions in normal government operation due to COVID-19 has resulted in a three to four month delay in the 2019 year-end reporting process. Compliance with the finding recommendation will be evaluated during our next audit of the plan.

WASHINGTON TOWNSHIP NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
POTENTIAL WITHHOLD OF STATE AID

Finding No. 1 contained in this audit report cites an overpayment of state aid to the township in the amount of \$25,349, plus interest. A condition of this nature may lead to a total withholding of state aid in the future unless that finding is corrected. A check in this amount with interest, at a rate earned by the pension plan, should be made payable to: Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, and mailed to: Department of the Auditor General, Municipal Pension & Fire Relief Programs Unit, 321 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120.

WASHINGTON TOWNSHIP NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
 (UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF CONTRIBUTIONS

Year Ended December 31	Statutorily Required Contribution (SRC)*	Contribution in Relation to the SRC*	Contribution Deficiency (Excess)**	Covered- Employee Payroll***	Contributions as a Percentage of Covered- Employee Payroll
2014	\$ 32,231	\$ 32,245	\$ (14)	\$ 431,490	7.5%
2015	32,604	32,049	555	459,195	7.0%
2016	36,906	36,947	(41)	521,235	7.1%
2017	37,978	15,830	22,148	535,976	3.0%
2018	40,215	17,146	23,069	568,214	3.0%
2019	40,455	40,455	-		

* The Statutorily Required Contribution is a contribution amount based upon the payroll and the contribution rate as outlined under the terms of the cash balance pension plan.

** The Statutorily Required Contribution and the actual Contributions were provided by PMRS. Deviation between these amounts may be due to contributions to or transfers from the Municipal account including plan forfeitures applied to statutorily determined contribution for the year.

*** Due to the timing of this audit, covered-employee payroll for 2019 was not provided in this schedule.

WASHINGTON TOWNSHIP NON-UNIFORMED PENSION PLAN
REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

The Honorable Tom W. Wolf
Governor
Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

The Honorable David Patterson
Mayor

Mr. Mike Feikles
Vice Mayor

Mr. David L. Anthony
Township Manager

Ms. Kelly Harrison
Accounting

Ms. Charity Rosenberry, CPA
Pennsylvania Municipal Retirement System

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at www.PaAuditor.gov. Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 229 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: news@PaAuditor.gov.