ATTESTATION ENGAGEMENT

Township of Franklin

Erie County, Pennsylvania 25-206

Liquid Fuels Tax Fund
For the Period
January 1, 2020 to December 31, 2022

May 2024



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General

Timothy L. DeFoor • Auditor General



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General
Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018
Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General
Twitter: @PAAuditorGen
www.PaAuditor.gov

TIMOTHY L. DEFOOR AUDITOR GENERAL

Independent Auditor's Report

The Honorable Michael Carroll Secretary Department of Transportation Harrisburg, PA 17120

We examined the accompanying Forms MS-965 With Adjustments for the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund of the Township of Franklin, Erie County, for the period January 1, 2020 to December 31, 2022. The municipality's management is responsible for presenting the Forms MS-965 in accordance with the criteria described in the Background section of this report and the Department of Transportation's *Publication 9*. Our responsibility is to express an opinion on the Forms MS-965 With Adjustments based on our examination.

Our examination was conducted in accordance with attestation standards established by the American Institute of Certified Public Accountants and the standards applicable to attestation engagements contained in *Government Auditing Standards* issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. An examination involves performing procedures to obtain reasonable assurance about whether the Forms MS-965 are presented in accordance with the criteria described above, in all material respects. An examination involves performing procedures to obtain evidence about the Forms MS-965. The nature, timing and extent of the procedures selected depend on our judgement, including an assessment of the risks of material misstatement of the Forms MS-965, whether due to fraud or error. We believe that the evidence we obtained is sufficient and appropriate to provide a reasonable basis for our opinion.

We are required to be independent and to meet our other ethical responsibilities in accordance with ethical requirements relating to the engagement.

In our opinion, the Forms MS-965 With Adjustments present, in all material respects, the information required by the Pennsylvania Department of Transportation for the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund of the Township of Franklin, Erie County, for the period January 1, 2020 to December 31, 2022, in accordance with the criteria described in the Background section of this report and the Department of Transportation's *Publication 9*.

<u>Independent Auditor's Report (Continued)</u>

In accordance with Government Auditing Standards, we are required to report all deficiencies that are considered to be significant deficiencies or material weaknesses in internal control; fraud and noncompliance with provisions of laws or regulations that have a material effect on the Forms MS-965; any other instances that warrant the attention of those charged with governance; noncompliance with provisions of contracts or grant agreements; and abuse that has a material effect on the Forms MS-965. We are also required to obtain and report the views of responsible officials concerning the findings, conclusions, and recommendations, as well as any planned corrective actions. We performed our examination to express an opinion on whether the Forms MS-965 are presented in accordance with the criteria described above and not for the purpose of expressing an opinion on internal control over reporting on the Forms MS-965 or on compliance and other matters; accordingly, we express no such opinions.

A deficiency in internal control exists when the design or operation of a control does not allow management or employees, in the normal course of performing their assigned functions, to prevent, or detect and correct, misstatements on a timely basis. A material weakness is a deficiency, or combination of deficiencies, in internal control such that there is a reasonable possibility that a material misstatement of the Forms MS-965 will not be prevented, or detected and corrected, on a timely basis. A significant deficiency is a deficiency, or a combination of deficiencies, in internal control that is less severe than a material weakness, yet important enough to merit attention by those charged with governance.

Our consideration of internal control over reporting on the Forms MS-965 was for the limited purpose of expressing an opinion on whether the Forms MS-965 are presented in accordance with the criteria described above and would not necessarily identify all deficiencies in internal control that might be material weaknesses or significant deficiencies. Given these limitations, during our engagement we did not identify any deficiencies in internal control that we consider to be material weaknesses. However, material weaknesses may exist that have not been identified.

As part of obtaining reasonable assurance about whether the Forms MS-965 are free from material misstatement, we performed tests of the Township of Franklin, Erie County's compliance with certain provisions of laws, regulations, contracts, and grant agreements, noncompliance with which could have a direct and material effect on the determination of amounts on the Forms MS-965. However, providing an opinion on compliance with those provisions was not an objective of our engagement, and accordingly, we do not express such an opinion. The results of our tests disclosed no instances of noncompliance or other matters that are required to be reported under *Government Auditing Standards*. However, we did note a matter that, while not required to be included in this report by *Government Auditing Standards*, has been included in the finding below:

• Nonpermissible Expenditure.

<u>Independent Auditor's Report (Continued)</u>

The purpose of this report is to determine whether the municipality's Liquid Fuels Tax Fund money is spent in accordance with the laws and regulations identified in the Background section of this report and the Department of Transportation's *Publication 9*. This report is not suitable for any other purpose.

We appreciate the courtesy extended by the Township of Franklin, Erie County, to us during the course of our examination. If you have any questions, please feel free to contact the Bureau of County Audits at 717-787-1363.

Timothy L. DeFoor Auditor General

Timothy L. Detoor

April 5, 2024

CONTENTS

<u>Pa</u>	ge
Background	1
Financial Section:	
2020 Form MS-965 With Adjustments	5
2021 Form MS-965 With Adjustments	8
2022 Form MS-965 With Adjustments	11
Auditor Description Of Select Transactions	14
Finding And Recommendation:	
Finding - Nonpermissible Expenditure	15
Summary Of Onsite Closeout Meeting	16
Report Distribution	17

Background

The Liquid Fuels Tax Municipal Allocation Law, Act 655 of 1956, as amended, see also 72 P.S. § 2615.5, et sec., provides municipalities other than counties (i.e., townships, boroughs, cities, towns, home rule, and optional plan governments) with an annual allocation of liquid fuels taxes from the state's Motor License Fund to be used for the maintenance and repair of streets, roads, and bridges for which the municipality is responsible. The allocation of these funds to municipalities is based upon: (1) 50 percent on the municipality's proportion of local road mileage to the total local road mileage in the state; and (2) 50 percent on the proportion of a municipality's population to the total population in the state.

Title 75 Pa.C.S. § 9511 of the Pennsylvania Vehicle Code provides municipalities with annual maintenance payments to be received from the Motor License Fund for functionally local highways that were transferred to a municipality from the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania.

Each municipality must deposit the allocation of Liquid Fuels Tax funds and annual maintenance payments that it receives into a special fund called either the Municipal Liquid Fuels Tax Fund or State Fund. A municipality may not deposit any other monies into this fund except when the municipality does not have enough money in the special fund to meet the payments called for by its current annual budget for road and bridge purposes. In such a case, the municipality may borrow money or transfer money from its General Fund to its Liquid Fuels Tax Fund.

The Department of Transportation has been given the regulatory authority for the administration of these funds. Department of Transportation's *Publication 9* includes the policies and procedures for the administration of Act 655, as amended, and the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund money. However, if there is a difference between *Publication 9* and any legislation, the legislation shall govern.

To qualify for the annual allocation of Liquid Fuels Tax funds, *Publication 9* indicates that each municipality shall:

- 1. Submit annual reports (MS-965, Actual Use Report, MS-965P, Project and Miscellaneous Receipts, and MS-965S, Record of Checks).
- 2. Make deposits and payments or expenditures in compliance with Act 655 of 1956, as amended. Failure to do so may result in not receiving allocations from PennDOT until all discrepancies are resolved. *Publication 9*, Section 2.6, includes information about investing Liquid Fuels Tax monies, using loan or bond proceeds, and types of receipts into the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund.

Background (Continued)

- 3. Submit the Pennsylvania Department of Community and Economic Development's (DCED) Report of Elected and Appointed Officials by January 31st and the Survey of Financial Condition By March 15th.
- 4. Ensure resolution of all Contractor Responsibility Program (CRP) holds and blocks imposed by the Department of Revenue and the Department of Labor and Industry.
- 5. Ensure resolution of all reimbursements required as a result of audits performed by the Department of the Auditor General or monitoring reviews performed by the Department of Transportation's Financial Consultants.

Criteria

The criteria for the Form MS-965 With Adjustment are described below.

Section 1 of Form MS-965 With Adjustments provides a summary of Liquid Fuels Tax Fund expenditures by category. Categories requiring explanation include:

• Major equipment purchases are purchases of road machinery and road equipment with varying yearly costs in excess of the amounts indicated below:

2020	2021	2022	2023
\$11,300.00	\$11,500.00	\$11,800.00	\$12,200.00

• Minor equipment purchases are purchases of road machinery and road equipment with varying yearly costs that are less than or equal to the amounts indicated below:

2020	2021	2022	2023
\$11,300.00	\$11,500.00	\$11,800.00	\$12,200.00

• Agility projects are exchanges of services with the Department of Transportation.

Background (Continued)

Section 2 of Form MS-965 With Adjustments provides information on the fund balance. Categories requiring explanation include:

- The state allocation is available from the Department of Transportation in March of each year. The amount the municipality receives is based half on its population and half on its road mileage.
- Municipalities that transferred roads from the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania to the municipality through the Highway Transfer Program receive annual turnback allocations in March of each year from the Department of Transportation. Turnback allocations are based on the mileage of the roads transferred.
- Expenditures include the total transferred from Section 1.

Section 3 of Form MS-965 With Adjustments determines if the municipality expended Liquid Fuels Tax Fund money in excess of the permissible amount for equipment and the balance that the municipality may carry forward for the purchase of equipment to the subsequent year.

Department of Transportation *Publication 9* requires that the amount expended for equipment purchases in a given year not exceed the sum of the equipment balance carried forward from the previous year and 20 percent of the current year's Liquid Fuels Tax Fund allocation and, if applicable, 20 percent of the turnback allocation plus other Department of Transportation approved adjustments.

If the municipality spent in excess of the amount listed on Line 4, the excess must be reimbursed to the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund.

The equipment balance to be carried forward for the subsequent year is the lesser of the amount on Line 6 or the ending fund balance on Line 6 of Section 2, but not less than zero.

Background (Continued)

Basis of Presentation

The financial activities of the municipality are accounted for in separate funds. The Liquid Fuels Tax Fund is used to account for state aid revenues from the Pennsylvania Department of Transportation used primarily for building and improving local roads and bridges. The Form MS-965 has been prepared in accordance with reporting requirements prescribed by the Pennsylvania Department of Transportation as a result of the Fuels Tax Act 655, dated 1956 and as amended, which does not constitute a complete presentation of the entity's assets, liabilities, expenses, and fund balance. Accordingly, the presentation of Form MS-965 With Adjustments is restricted to the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund, which represents a segment of the entity.

Basis Of Accounting

The accompanying Forms MS-965 With Adjustments is prepared in accordance with reporting requirements prescribed by the Pennsylvania Department of Transportation. Under this method, revenues are recognized when received and expenditures are recorded when paid.

General Fixed Assets

General fixed assets are recognized as expenditures at the time of purchase. No depreciation has been provided on the heavy equipment used to maintain and repair roads and bridges.

TOWNSHIP OF FRANKLIN ERIE COUNTY LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND 2020 FORM MS-965 – SECTION 1 WITH ADJUSTMENTS

Expenditure Summary	Reported		Adjustments		Adjusted Amount	
Minor equipment purchases	\$	-	\$	-	\$	-
Computer/Computer related training		-		-		-
Major equipment purchases		36,368.00		-		36,368.00
Agility projects		-		-		-
Cleaning streets and gutters		-		-		-
Winter maintenance services		3,045.60		-		3,045.60
Traffic control devices		802.00		-		802.00
Street lighting		-		-		-
Storm sewers and drains		-		-		-
Repairs of tools and machinery		7,558.47		-		7,558.47
Maintenance and repair of						
roads and bridges		104,398.45		-		104,398.45
Highway construction and						
rebuilding projects		-		-		-
Miscellaneous						
Total (To Section 2, Line 5)	\$	152,172.52	\$	_	\$	152,172.52

TOWNSHIP OF FRANKLIN ERIE COUNTY LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND 2020 FORM MS-965 – SECTION 2 WITH ADJUSTMENTS

Fund Balance		Reported		Reported		Adjustments		Adjusted Amount
1. Balance, January 1, 2020	\$	58,048.64	\$	-	\$	58,048.64		
Receipts: 2. State allocation		137,402.47		-		137,402.47		
2a. Turnback allocation2b. Interest on investments2c. Miscellaneous		- 422.24 -		- -		- 422.24 -		
3. Total receipts		137,824.71				137,824.71		
4. Total funds available		195,873.35				195,873.35		
5. Expenditures (Section 1)		152,172.52				152,172.52		
6. Balance, December 31, 2020	\$	43,700.83	\$		\$	43,700.83		

TOWNSHIP OF FRANKLIN ERIE COUNTY LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND 2020 FORM MS-965 – SECTION 3 WITH ADJUSTMENTS

Equipment Balance	Reported		Reported		Reported		Reported		Adju	stments	 Adjusted Amount
1. Prior year equipment balance	\$	40,079.34	\$	-	\$ 40,079.34						
2. Add: Current year equipment allocation (20% of Lines 2 + 2a, Section 2)		27,480.49		-	27,480.49						
3. PENNDOT approved adjustments											
4. Total funds available for equipment acquisition		67,559.83		-	67,559.83						
5. Less: Major equipment expenditures		36,368.00			36,368.00						
6. Remainder	-	31,191.83			 31,191.83						
7. Equipment balance available for subsequent year (Lesser of Line 6 or Section 2 balance, but not less than zero)	\$	31,191.83	\$	-	\$ 31,191.83						

TOWNSHIP OF FRANKLIN ERIE COUNTY LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND 2021 FORM MS-965 – SECTION 1 WITH ADJUSTMENTS

Expenditure Summary	Reported		ported Adjustments		Adjusted Amount	
Minor equipment purchases	\$	-	\$	-	\$	-
Computer/Computer related training		-		-		-
Major equipment purchases		-		-		-
Agility projects		-		-		-
Cleaning streets and gutters		-		-		-
Winter maintenance services		4,086.90		-		4,086.90
Traffic control devices		-		-		-
Street lighting		-		-		-
Storm sewers and drains		-		-		-
Repairs of tools and machinery		3,996.00		-		3,996.00
Maintenance and repair of						
roads and bridges		43,767.98		-		43,767.98
Highway construction and						
rebuilding projects		-		-		-
Miscellaneous						
Total (To Section 2, Line 5)	\$	51,850.88	\$		\$	51,850.88

TOWNSHIP OF FRANKLIN ERIE COUNTY LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND 2021 FORM MS-965 – SECTION 2 WITH ADJUSTMENTS

Fund Balance	Reported	Adjustments	Adjusted Amount
1. Balance, January 1, 2021	\$ 43,700.83	\$ -	\$ 43,700.83
Receipts: 2. State allocation	125,939.43		125,939.43
2a. Turnback allocation	123,939.43	- -	123,939.43
2b. Interest on investments	16.11	-	16.11
2c. Miscellaneous			
3. Total receipts	125,955.54		125,955.54
4. Total funds available	169,656.37		169,656.37
5. Expenditures (Section 1)	51,850.88		51,850.88
6. Balance, December 31, 2021	\$ 117,805.49	_ \$	\$ 117,805.49

TOWNSHIP OF FRANKLIN ERIE COUNTY LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND 2021 FORM MS-965 – SECTION 3 WITH ADJUSTMENTS

Equipment Balance	Reported		Reported		Reported		Reported		Reported		Reported		Reported		Reported		Reported		Reported		Reported		Reported		Reported		Reported		Reported		Reported		Reported		Reported		Reported		Reported		Reported		Reported		Reported Adjustm		Adjusted Amount	
1. Prior year equipment balance	\$	31,191.83	\$	-	\$	31,191.83																																										
2. Add: Current year equipment allocation (20% of Lines 2 + 2a, Section 2)		25,187.89		-		25,187.89																																										
3. PENNDOT approved adjustments						<u>-</u>																																										
4. Total funds available for equipment acquisition		56,379.72		-		56,379.72																																										
5. Less: Major equipment expenditures		<u>-</u>																																														
6. Remainder		56,379.72				56,379.72																																										
7. Equipment balance available for subsequent year (Lesser of Line 6 or Section 2 balance, but not less than zero)	\$	56,379.72	\$	_	\$	56,379.72																																										

TOWNSHIP OF FRANKLIN ERIE COUNTY LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND 2022 FORM MS-965 – SECTION 1 WITH ADJUSTMENTS

Expenditure Summary	re Summary Reported		Adjustments		Adjusted Amount	
Minor equipment purchases	\$	-	\$	-	\$	-
Computer/Computer related training		-		-		-
Major equipment purchases		30,000.00		-		30,000.00
Agility projects		-		-		-
Cleaning streets and gutters		-		-		-
Winter maintenance services		3,240.35		-		3,240.35
Traffic control devices		-		-		-
Street lighting		-		-		-
Storm sewers and drains		-		-		-
Repairs of tools and machinery		11,149.59		-		11,149.59
Maintenance and repair of						
roads and bridges		168,445.43		-		168,445.43
Highway construction and						
rebuilding projects		-		-		-
Miscellaneous		-		-		
Total (To Section 2, Line 5)	_\$_	212,835.37	\$	-	\$	212,835.37

TOWNSHIP OF FRANKLIN ERIE COUNTY LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND 2022 FORM MS-965 – SECTION 2 WITH ADJUSTMENTS

Fund Balance	Reported	Reported Adjustments	
1. Balance, January 1, 2022	\$ 117,805.49	\$ -	\$ 117,805.49
Receipts:			
2. State allocation	124,313.09	-	124,313.09
2a. Turnback allocation	-	-	-
2b. Interest on investments	1,381.28	-	1,381.28
2c. Miscellaneous	5,100.57		5,100.57
3. Total receipts	130,794.94	<u> </u>	130,794.94
4. Total funds available	248,600.43	<u> </u>	248,600.43
5. Expenditures (Section 1)	212,835.37	<u> </u>	212,835.37
6. Balance, December 31, 2022	\$ 35,765.06	\$ -	\$ 35,765.06

TOWNSHIP OF FRANKLIN ERIE COUNTY LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND 2022 FORM MS-965 – SECTION 3 WITH ADJUSTMENTS

Equipment Balance	Reported		Reported		Reported		Reported		Reported		Reported		Reported		Reported		Adju	stments	 Adjusted Amount
1. Prior year equipment balance	\$	56,379.72	\$	-	\$ 56,379.72														
2. Add: Current year equipment allocation (20% of Lines 2 + 2a, Section 2)		24,862.62		-	24,862.62														
3. PENNDOT approved adjustments					 														
4. Total funds available for equipment acquisition		81,242.34		-	81,242.34														
5. Less: Major equipment expenditures		30,000.00			30,000.00														
6. Remainder		51,242.34			 51,242.34														
7. Equipment balance available for subsequent year (Lesser of Line 6 or Section 2 balance, but not less than zero)	\$	35,765.06	\$		\$ 35,765.06														

TOWNSHIP OF FRANKLIN ERIE COUNTY LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND AUDITOR DESCRIPTION OF SELECT TRANSACTIONS FOR THE PERIOD JANUARY 1, 2020 TO DECEMBER 31, 2022

The following information relates to certain types of transactions for which the Pennsylvania Department of Transportation requested that we provide additional detail:

Miscellaneous Receipts

The following miscellaneous receipts were deposited into the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund during the examination period:

Source	Description	2022
Wayne Township	Reimbursement for seal	
	coating	\$3,420.57
General Fund	Reimbursement (Finding)	1,680.00
Totals		\$5,100.57

Lease Purchase Agreement

On January 23, 2020, the municipality purchased a 2020 John Deere grader for \$266,368.00. The municipality made down payments of \$36,368.00 and \$30,000.00 from the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund and the Equipment Fund, respectively. The down payment from the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund is reflected in major equipment purchases on the 2020 Form MS-965 - Section 1. The municipality entered into a lease-purchase agreement for the remaining \$200,000.00 with John Deere Financial for a term of five years at an interest rate of 3.70 percent. Principal and interest payments of \$44,627.06 are due annually.

During the current examination period, the municipality paid principal of \$75,596.75 and interest of \$13,657.37 from the Equipment Fund. The outstanding balance of the lease-purchase agreement as of December 31, 2022, was \$124,403.25, plus interest.

TOWNSHIP OF FRANKLIN ERIE COUNTY LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND FINDING AND RECOMMENDATION FOR THE PERIOD JANUARY 1, 2020 TO DECEMBER 31, 2022

Finding - Nonpermissible Expenditure

Our examination disclosed that the municipality expended \$1,680.00 during 2022 from the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund for salt brine for dust control, which is a nonpermissible expenditure.

The Liquid Fuels Tax Municipal Allocation Law, 72 P.S. § 2615.4, provides, in part, that monies herein allocated may be used only for construction, reconstruction, maintenance, and repairs of such public roads or streets, including bridges, culverts and drainage structures, for which they are legally responsible. Also permitted are expenditures involving acquisition, maintenance, repairs and operation of street signs, traffic signs, traffic signal control systems, road equipment, and snow fences.

The Department of Transportation has been statutorily authorized to promulgate regulations concerning the administration of Liquid Fuels Tax Fund money and has determined that certain items, including salt brine used for dust control, are outside the scope of permissible expenditures.

On December 21, 2022, the municipality reimbursed \$1,680.00 to the Liquid Fuels Tax Fund.

The secretary/treasurer stated that this condition occurred because the municipality was misinformed by the vendor that it was a permissible expenditure.

Recommendation

We recommend that the municipality comply with the Liquid Fuels Tax Municipal Allocation Law and the Department of Transportation's Regulations regarding permissible expenditures.

Management's Response

The secretary/treasurer stated:

The vendor told us they were state approved, so we paid for salt brine out of Liquid Fuels account. However, when we discovered it was nonpermissible, we reimbursed the money back to Liquid Fuels.

Auditor's Conclusion

During our next examination, we will determine if the municipality complied with our recommendation.

TOWNSHIP OF FRANKLIN ERIE COUNTY LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND SUMMARY OF ONSITE CLOSEOUT MEETING FOR THE PERIOD JANUARY 1, 2020 TO DECEMBER 31, 2022

An onsite closeout meeting was held February 1, 2024. Those participating were:

TOWNSHIP OF FRANKLIN

Ms. Ramona Junkins, Secretary/Treasurer

DEPARTMENT OF THE AUDITOR GENERAL

Mr. R.J. Zonna, Auditor

This report was initially distributed to:

The Honorable Michael Carroll

Secretary
Department of Transportation

Township of Franklin
Erie County
10411 Route 98
Edinboro, PA 16412

The Honorable Dennis D. Howard Chairman of the Board of Supervisors

Ms. Ramona Junkins Secretary/Treasurer

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at www.PaAuditor.gov. Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 229 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: news@PaAuditor.gov.