# **COMPLIANCE AUDIT**

# Bradford Township Police Pension Plan

McKean County, Pennsylvania For the Period January 1, 2016 to December 31, 2017

# September 2018



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General

Eugene A. DePasquale • Auditor General





Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General
Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018
Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General
Twitter: @PAAuditorGen
www.PaAuditor.gov

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE AUDITOR GENERAL

Board of Township Supervisors Bradford Township McKean County Bradford, PA 16701

We have conducted a compliance audit of the Bradford Township Police Pension Plan for the period January 1, 2016 to December 31, 2017. We also evaluated compliance with some requirements subsequent to that period when possible. The audit was conducted pursuant to authority derived from Section 402(j) of Act 205 and in accordance with the standards applicable to performance audits contained in *Government Auditing Standards* issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our conclusions based on our audit objective. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our conclusions based on our audit objective.

The objective of the audit was to determine if the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objective identified above. To determine whether the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, our methodology included the following:

- We determined whether state aid was properly determined and deposited in accordance with Act 205 requirements by verifying the annual deposit date of state aid and determining whether deposits were made within 30 days of receipt for all years within the period under audit.
- We determined whether annual employer contributions were calculated and deposited in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by examining the municipality's calculation of the plan's annual financial requirements and minimum municipal obligation (MMO) and comparing these calculated amounts to amounts actually budgeted and deposited into the pension plan as evidenced by supporting documentation.

- We determined whether annual employee contributions were calculated, deducted, and deposited into the pension plan in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by testing total members' contributions on an annual basis using the rates obtained from the plan's governing document in effect for all years within the period under audit and examining documents evidencing the deposit of these employee contributions into the pension plan.
- · We determined that there were no benefit calculations prepared for the years covered by our audit period.
- We determined whether the January 1, 2015 and January 1, 2017 actuarial valuation reports were prepared and submitted by March 31, 2016 and 2018, respectively, in accordance with Act 205 and whether selected information provided on these reports is accurate, complete, and in accordance with plan provisions to ensure compliance for participation in the state aid program by comparing selected information to supporting source documentation.

Bradford Township contracted with an independent certified public accounting firm for an audit of its basic financial statements for the year ended December 31, 2016, which are available at the township's offices. Those financial statements were not audited by us and, accordingly, we express no opinion or other form of assurance on them.

Township officials are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the Bradford Township Police Pension Plan is administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies. In conducting our audit, we obtained an understanding of the township's internal controls as they relate to the township's compliance with those requirements and that we considered to be significant within the context of our audit objective, and assessed whether those significant controls were properly designed and implemented. Additionally and as previously described, we tested transactions, assessed official actions, performed analytical procedures, and interviewed selected officials to provide reasonable assurance of detecting instances of noncompliance with legal and regulatory requirements or noncompliance with provisions of contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies that are significant within the context of the audit objective.

The results of our procedures indicated that, in all significant respects, the Bradford Township Police Pension Plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

The accompanying supplementary information is presented for purposes of additional analysis. We did not audit the information or conclude on it and, accordingly, express no form of assurance on it.

The contents of this report were discussed with officials of Bradford Township and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report. We would like to thank township officials for the cooperation extended to us during the conduct of the audit.

September 6, 2018

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE

Eugent: O-Pager

**Auditor General** 

# CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
Background	1
Supplementary Information	3
Report Distribution List	10

#### **BACKGROUND**

On December 18, 1984, the Pennsylvania Legislature adopted the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act (P.L. 1005, No. 205, as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.101 et seq.). The Act established mandatory actuarial reporting and funding requirements and a uniform basis for the distribution of state aid to Pennsylvania's public pension plans. Section 402(j) of Act 205 specifically requires the Auditor General, as deemed necessary, to make an audit of every municipality which receives general municipal pension system state aid and of every municipal pension plan and fund in which general municipal pension system state aid is deposited.

Annual state aid allocations are provided from a 2 percent foreign (out-of-state) casualty insurance premium tax, a portion of the foreign (out-of-state) fire insurance tax designated for paid firefighters and any investment income earned on the collection of these taxes. Generally, municipal pension plans established prior to December 18, 1984, are eligible for state aid. For municipal pension plans established after that date, the sponsoring municipality must fund the plan for three plan years before it becomes eligible for state aid. In accordance with Act 205, a municipality's annual state aid allocation cannot exceed its actual pension costs.

In addition to Act 205, the Bradford Township Police Pension Plan is also governed by implementing regulations adopted by the former Public Employee Retirement Commission published at Title 16, Part IV of the Pennsylvania Code and applicable provisions of various other state statutes including, but not limited to, the following:

Act 600 - Police Pension Fund Act, Act of May 29, 1956 (P.L. 1804, No. 600), as amended, 53 P.S. § 767 et seq.

The Bradford Township Police Pension Plan is a single-employer defined benefit pension plan locally controlled by the provisions of Ordinance No. 2014-12-03, adopted pursuant to Act 600. The plan is also affected by the provisions of collective bargaining agreements between the township and its police officers. The plan was established October 28, 1974. Active members are required to contribute 5 percent of compensation to the plan. As of December 31, 2017, the plan had 5 active members, no terminated members eligible for vested benefits in the future, and 5 retirees receiving pension benefits from the plan.

#### **BACKGROUND** – (Continued)

As of December 31, 2017, selected plan benefit provisions are as follows:

#### **Eligibility Requirements:**

Normal Retirement At age 50 and 25 years of service.

Early Retirement After 20 years of service.

Vesting A member is 100% vested after 12 years of service.

#### Retirement Benefit:

Benefit equals 50% of final 36 months average salary, plus a service increment equal to \$100 per month after 26 years of service.

#### **Survivor Benefit:**

Before Retirement Eligibility Refund of member contributions plus interest.

After Retirement Eligibility A monthly benefit equal to 50% of the pension the

member was receiving or was entitled to receive on the

day of the member's death.

#### Service Related Disability Benefit:

Benefit equals 75% of the member's highest monthly compensation, offset by Social Security disability benefits received for the same injury.

The supplementary information contained on Pages 3 through 6 reflects the implementation of GASB Statement No. 67, *Financial Reporting for Pension Plans*. The objective of this statement is to improve financial reporting by state and local governmental pension plans.

#### SCHEDULE OF CHANGES IN THE NET PENSION LIABILITY AND RELATED RATIOS FOR THE YEARS ENDED DECEMBER 31, 2008, 2009, 2010, 2011, AND 2012

		<u>2008</u>		<u>2009</u>		<u>2010</u>		<u>2011</u>		<u>2012</u>
Total Pension Liability										
Service cost	\$	54,933	\$	48,114	\$	54,364	\$	40,006	\$	44,799
Interest		87,277		96,546		93,026		100,802		120,574
Difference between expected and actual experience		-		(186,799)		-		157,798		-
Changes of assumptions		-		-		-		=		-
Benefit payments, including refunds of member contributions		=		(5,485)		(21,941)		(21,941)		(20,113)
Net Change in Total Pension Liability		142,210		(47,624)		125,449		276,665		145,260
Total Pension Liability – Beginning		1,191,877		1,334,087		1,286,463		1,411,912		1,688,577
Total Pension Liability - Ending (a)	\$	1,334,087	\$	1,286,463	\$	1,411,912	\$	1,688,577	\$	1,833,837
Nico P. L. Com Not Decision		_				_				
Plan Fiduciary Net Position	ď	42 210	¢		\$		¢		\$	
Contributions – employer Contributions – state aid	\$	42,310	\$	- 15 701	Þ	20.524	Þ	- 25.710	Ф	- 55.064
Contribution – state and Contribution – member		-		15,784		20,534		35,710		55,964
Net investment income		64,321		(647,551)		252,964		176,814		(49,713)
Benefit payments, including refunds of member contributions		04,321		(5,485)		(21,941)		(21,941)		(20,113)
Administrative expense		(6,197)		(7,310)		(3,206)		(21,941) $(3,975)$		(4,600)
Net Change in Plan Fiduciary Net Position		100,434		(644,562)		248,351		186,608		(18,462)
Plan Fiduciary Net Position – Beginning		1,662,811		1,763,245		1,118,683		1,367,034		1,553,642
·	Φ.		\$		Φ		\$		Φ.	
Plan Fiduciary Net Position - Ending (b)	<u> </u>	1,763,245	<b></b>	1,118,683	<u> </u>	1,367,034	<b></b>	1,553,642	<u> </u>	1,535,180
Net Pension Liability - Ending (a-b)	\$	(429,158)	\$	167,780	\$	44,878	\$	134,935	\$	298,657
Plan Fiduciary Net Position as a Percentage of the Total Pension Liability		132.17%		86.96%		96.82%		92.01%		83.71%
Estimated Covered Employee Payroll	\$	275,629	\$	266,560	\$	301,188	\$	284,536	\$	318,625
Net Pension Liability as a Percentage of Covered Employee Payroll		(155.70)%		62.94%		14.90%		47.42%		93.73%

The above schedule, prepared by the plan actuary, uses a measurement date of January 1.

# SCHEDULE OF CHANGES IN THE NET PENSION LIABILITY AND RELATED RATIOS FOR THE YEARS ENDED DECEMBER 31, 2013, 2014, 2015, 2016, AND 2017

	<u>2013</u>	<u>2014</u>		<u>2015</u>	<u>2016</u>	<u>2017</u>
Total Pension Liability						
Service cost	\$ 52,421	\$ 49,881	\$	68,043	\$ 70,085	\$ 73,367
Interest	130,149	128,570		135,415	137,696	145,272
Difference between expected and actual experience	(127,695)	-		(70,932)	-	57,747
Changes of assumptions	-	-		-	-	132,556
Benefit payments, including refunds of member contributions	 (49,812)	 (96,132)		(101,087)	 (102,749)	 (102,922)
Net Change in Total Pension Liability	5,063	82,319		31,439	105,032	306,020
Total Pension Liability – Beginning	 1,833,837	 1,838,900		1,921,219	 1,952,658	 2,057,690
Total Pension Liability - Ending (a)	\$ 1,838,900	\$ 1,921,219	\$	1,952,658	\$ 2,057,690	\$ 2,363,710
Plan Fiduciary Net Position		 				
Contributions – employer	\$ 28,544	\$ -	\$	68,883	\$ 46,244	\$ 26,419
Contributions – state aid	35,761	38,844		38,729	39,208	43,747
Contribution – member	11,722	12,086		13,546	13,449	13,778
Net investment income	150,452	266,380		75,370	(52,730)	160,212
Benefit payments, including refunds of member contributions	(49,812)	(96,132)		(101,087)	(102,749)	(102,922)
Administrative expense	 (2,200)	 (4,350)		(2,575)	(5,320)	(3,083)
Net Change in Plan Fiduciary Net Position	174,467	216,828		92,866	(61,898)	 138,151
Plan Fiduciary Net Position - Beginning	1,535,180	1,709,647		1,926,475	2,019,341	1,957,443
Plan Fiduciary Net Position - Ending (b)	\$ 1,709,647	\$ 1,926,475	\$	2,019,341	\$ 1,957,443	\$ 2,095,594
			-			 
Net Pension Liability - Ending (a-b)	\$ 129,253	\$ (5,256)	\$	(66,683)	\$ 100,247	\$ 268,116
Plan Fiduciary Net Position as a Percentage of the Total Pension Liability	92.97%	100.27%		103.41%	95.13%	88.66%
Train Fladerary 14ct Fosition as a Fercentage of the Total Fension Endomity	72.7170	100.2770		103.4170	73.1370	00.0070
Estimated Covered Employee Payroll	\$ 319,249	\$ 303,783	\$	338,521	\$ 362,024	\$ 372,371
Net Pension Liability as a Percentage of Covered Employee Payroll	40.49%	(1.73)%		(19.70)%	27.69%	72.00%

The above schedule, prepared by the plan actuary, uses a measurement date of January 1.

#### Sensitivity of the Net Pension Liability to Changes in the Discount Rate

The following presents the net pension liability of the township as of January 1, 2015, 2016 and 2017, calculated using the discount rate of 7.0%, as well as what the township's net pension liability would be if it were calculated using a discount rate that is 1 percentage-point lower or 1 percentage-point higher than the current rate:

	1%	Decrease (6.0%)	Current scount Rate (7.0%)	1% Increase (8.0%)		
Net Pension Liability – 01/01/15	\$	177,685	\$ (66,683)	\$	(272,092)	
Net Pension Liability - 01/01/16	\$	357,759	\$ 100,247	\$	(116,211)	
Net Pension Liability - 01/01/17	\$	582,627	\$ 268,116	\$	5,493	

#### SCHEDULE OF CONTRIBUTIONS

Year Ended December 31	Det	tuarially termined ntribution		Actual tributions	De	ntribution eficiency Excess)	Covered- Employee Payroll	Contributions as a Percentage of Covered- Employee Payroll
2000	Ф	15 704	Ф	15 704	ф		¢ 266.560	5.000
2008	\$	15,784	\$	15,784	\$	-	\$ 266,560	5.92%
2009		20,534		20,534		-	301,188	6.82%
2010		35,710		35,710		-	284,536	12.55%
2011		42,453		55,964		(13,511)	318,625	17.56%
2012		64,305		64,305		_	319,249	20.14%
2013		62,538		38,844		23,694	303,783	12.79%
2014		83,918		107,612		(23,694)	338,521	31.79%
2015		85,452		85,452		_	362,024	23.60%
2016		70,166		70,166		-	372,371	18.84%
2017		72,394		72,394		-	387,866	18.66%

# SCHEDULE OF INVESTMENT RETURNS

Annual Money-Weighted Rate of Return, Net of Investment Expense:

2016	8.23%
2015	(2.62)%
2014	3.89%
2013	15.81%
2012	9.72%
2011	(3.17)%
2010	12.89%
2009	22.66%
2008	(36.69)%
2007	3.83%

#### SCHEDULE OF FUNDING PROGRESS

Historical trend information about the plan is presented herewith as supplementary information. It is intended to help users assess the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis, assess progress made in accumulating assets to pay benefits when due, and make comparisons with other state and local government retirement systems.

The actuarial information is required by Act 205 biennially. The historical information, beginning as of January 1, 2013, is as follows:

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
			Unfunded	
		Actuarial	(Assets in	
		Accrued	Excess of)	
	Actuarial	Liability	Actuarial	
Actuarial	Value of	(AAL) -	Accrued	Funded
Valuation	Assets	Entry Age	Liability	Ratio
Date	(a)	(b)	(b) - (a)	(a)/(b)
01-01-13	\$ 1,709,647	\$ 1,838,900	\$ 129,253	93.0%
01-01-15	2,019,341	1,952,658	(66,683)	103.4%
01-01-17	2,095,594	2,363,710	268,116	88.7%

The comparability of trend information is affected by changes in actuarial assumptions, benefit provisions, actuarial funding methods, accounting policies, and other changes. Those changes usually affect trends in contribution requirements and in ratios that use the actuarial accrued liability as a factor.

Analysis of the dollar amount of the actuarial value of assets, actuarial accrued liability, and unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability in isolation can be misleading. Expressing the actuarial value of assets as a percentage of the actuarial accrued liability (Column 4) provides one indication of the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis. Analysis of this percentage, over time, indicates whether the system is becoming financially stronger or weaker. Generally, the greater this percentage, the stronger the plan.

## BRADFORD TOWNSHIP POLICE PENSION PLAN SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION NOTES TO SUPPLEMENTARY SCHEDULES (UNAUDITED)

The information presented in the supplementary schedules was determined as part of the actuarial valuation at the date indicated. Additional information as of the latest actuarial valuation date follows:

Actuarial valuation date January 1, 2017

Actuarial cost method Entry age normal

Amortization method Level dollar

Remaining amortization period 15 years

Asset valuation method Market value

Actuarial assumptions:

Investment rate of return 7.0%

Projected salary increases 4.0%

Cost-of-living adjustments 2.5% per year

#### BRADFORD TOWNSHIP POLICE PENSION PLAN REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

The Honorable Tom W. Wolf

Governor Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

Mr. James B. Erwin

Chairman, Board of Township Supervisors

Mr. Steven L. Mascho Township Supervisor

**Ms. Gayle E. Bauer** Township Supervisor

Ms. Susan K. Gibiser Secretary

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at <a href="www.PaAuditor.gov">www.PaAuditor.gov</a>. Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 229 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: news@PaAuditor.gov.