

COMPLIANCE AUDIT

Turtle Creek Borough Police Pension Plan Allegheny County, Pennsylvania For the Period January 1, 2015 to December 31, 2017

March 2019



Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General

Eugene A. DePasquale • Auditor General



**Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
Department of the Auditor General
Harrisburg, PA 17120-0018
Facebook: Pennsylvania Auditor General
Twitter: @PAAuditorGen
www.PaAuditor.gov**

**EUGENE A. DePASQUALE
AUDITOR GENERAL**

The Honorable Mayor and Borough Council
Turtle Creek Borough
Allegheny County
Turtle Creek, PA 15145

We have conducted a compliance audit of the Turtle Creek Borough Police Pension Plan for the period January 1, 2015 to December 31, 2017. We also evaluated compliance with some requirements subsequent to that period when possible. The audit was conducted pursuant to authority derived from Section 402(j) of Act 205 and in accordance with the standards applicable to performance audits contained in *Government Auditing Standards* issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our conclusions based on our audit objective. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our conclusions based on our audit objective.

The objective of the audit was to determine if the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

Our audit was limited to the areas related to the objective identified above. To determine whether the pension plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies, our methodology included the following:

- We determined whether state aid was properly determined and deposited in accordance with Act 205 requirements by verifying the annual deposit date of state aid and determining whether deposits were made within 30 days of receipt for all years within the period under audit.
- We determined whether annual employer contributions were calculated and deposited in accordance with the plan's governing document and applicable laws and regulations by examining the municipality's calculation of the plan's annual financial requirements and minimum municipal obligation (MMO) and comparing these calculated amounts to amounts actually budgeted and deposited into the pension plan as evidenced by supporting documentation.

- We determined that there were no employee contributions required for the years covered by our audit period due to the fact that employee contributions were appropriately waived by the municipality.
- We determined whether retirement benefits calculated for the 2 plan members who retired during the current audit period represent payments to all (and only) those entitled to receive them and were properly determined and disbursed in accordance with the plan's governing document, applicable laws and regulations by recalculating the amount of the monthly pension benefit due to retired individuals and comparing these amounts to supporting documentation evidencing amounts determined and actually paid to recipients.
- We determined whether the January 1, 2013, January 1, 2015, and January 1, 2017 actuarial valuation reports were prepared and submitted by March 31, 2014, 2016, and 2018, respectively, in accordance with Act 205 and whether selected information provided on these reports is accurate, complete, and in accordance with plan provisions to ensure compliance for participation in the state aid program by comparing selected information to supporting source documentation.

Borough officials are responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal controls to provide reasonable assurance that the Turtle Creek Borough Police Pension Plan is administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies. In conducting our audit, we obtained an understanding of the borough's internal controls as they relate to the borough's compliance with those requirements and that we considered to be significant within the context of our audit objective, and assessed whether those significant controls were properly designed and implemented. Additionally and as previously described, we tested transactions, assessed official actions, performed analytical procedures, and interviewed selected officials to provide reasonable assurance of detecting instances of noncompliance with legal and regulatory requirements or noncompliance with provisions of contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies that are significant within the context of the audit objective.

The results of our procedures indicated that, in all significant respects, the Turtle Creek Borough Police Pension Plan was administered in compliance with applicable state laws, regulations, contracts, administrative procedures, and local ordinances and policies.

The accompanying supplementary information is presented for purposes of additional analysis. We did not audit the information or conclude on it and, accordingly, express no form of assurance on it. However, we are extremely concerned about the historical trend information contained in the schedule of funding progress included in this report which indicates a decline of assets available to satisfy the long-term liabilities of the plan. **The plan's funded ratio went from 76.3% as of January 1, 2015, to a ratio of 69.1% as of January 1, 2017**, which is the most recent data available. We encourage borough officials to monitor the funding of the police pension plan to ensure its long-term financial stability.

The contents of this report were discussed with officials of Turtle Creek Borough and, where appropriate, their responses have been included in the report. We would like to thank borough officials for the cooperation extended to us during the conduct of the audit.

March 18, 2019

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Eugene A. DePasquale". The signature is fluid and cursive, with a long horizontal stroke extending to the right.

EUGENE A. DEPASQUALE
Auditor General

CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
Background.....	1
Supplementary Information	3
Report Distribution List	10

BACKGROUND

On December 18, 1984, the Pennsylvania Legislature adopted the Municipal Pension Plan Funding Standard and Recovery Act (P.L. 1005, No. 205, as amended, 53 P.S. § 895.101 et seq.). The Act established mandatory actuarial reporting and funding requirements and a uniform basis for the distribution of state aid to Pennsylvania's public pension plans. Section 402(j) of Act 205 specifically requires the Auditor General, as deemed necessary, to make an audit of every municipality which receives general municipal pension system state aid and of every municipal pension plan and fund in which general municipal pension system state aid is deposited.

Annual state aid allocations are provided from a 2 percent foreign (out-of-state) casualty insurance premium tax, a portion of the foreign (out-of-state) fire insurance tax designated for paid firefighters and any investment income earned on the collection of these taxes. Generally, municipal pension plans established prior to December 18, 1984, are eligible for state aid. For municipal pension plans established after that date, the sponsoring municipality must fund the plan for three plan years before it becomes eligible for state aid. In accordance with Act 205, a municipality's annual state aid allocation cannot exceed its actual pension costs.

In addition to Act 205, the Turtle Creek Borough Police Pension Plan is also governed by implementing regulations adopted by the former Public Employee Retirement Commission published at Title 16, Part IV of the Pennsylvania Code and applicable provisions of various other state statutes including, but not limited to, the following:

Act 600 - Police Pension Fund Act, Act of May 29, 1956 (P.L. 1804, No. 600), as amended, 53 P.S. § 767 et seq.

The Turtle Creek Borough Police Pension Plan is a single-employer defined benefit pension plan locally controlled by the provisions of Ordinance No. 1144, effective January 1, 2016, adopted pursuant to Act 600. Prior to January 1, 2016, the pension plan was controlled by the provisions of Ordinance No. 1119, as amended, adopted pursuant to Act 600. The plan is also affected by the provisions of collective bargaining agreements between the borough and its police officers. The plan was established October 7, 1957. Active members are required to contribute 5 percent of compensation to the plan; however, member contributions were eliminated during the audit period. As of December 31, 2017, the plan had 5 active members, no terminated members eligible for vested benefits in the future, and 10 retirees receiving pension benefits from the plan.

BACKGROUND – (Continued)

As of December 31, 2017, selected plan benefit provisions are as follows:

Eligibility Requirements:

Normal Retirement Age 50 and 25 years of service.

Early Retirement 20 years of service.

Vesting 100% after 12 years of service.

Retirement Benefit:

50% of final 36 months average salary, plus a service increment of \$100 per month for each year of service in excess of 25 years, up to a maximum of \$100.

Survivor Benefit:

Before Retirement Eligibility Refund of member contributions plus interest.

After Retirement Eligibility A monthly benefit equal to 50% of the pension the member was receiving or was entitled to receive on the day of the member's death. The monthly survivor benefits are payable to the participant's spouse for life. If there is no spouse or the spouse later dies, the benefit will be paid to the participant's dependent children, if any, until age 18, or age 23 if attending college.

Service Related Disability Benefit:

50% of the member's salary at the time the disability was incurred, offset by Social Security disability benefits received for the same injury.

TURTLE CREEK BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

The supplementary information contained on Pages 3 through 6 reflects the implementation of GASB Statement No. 67, *Financial Reporting for Pension Plans*. The objective of this statement is to improve financial reporting by state and local governmental pension plans.

SCHEDULE OF CHANGES IN THE NET PENSION
LIABILITY AND RELATED RATIOS
FOR THE YEARS ENDED DECEMBER 31, 2014 AND 2015

	<u>2014</u>	<u>2015</u>
Total Pension Liability		
Service cost	\$ 57,557	\$ 58,254
Interest	144,307	152,576
Difference between expected and actual experience	-	10,044
Benefit payments, including refunds of member contributions	<u>(92,368)</u>	<u>(104,946)</u>
Net Change in Total Pension Liability	109,496	115,928
Total Pension Liability – Beginning	1,978,255	2,087,751
Total Pension Liability – Ending (a)	<u>\$ 2,087,751</u>	<u>\$ 2,203,679</u>
Plan Fiduciary Net Position		
Contributions – employer	\$ 106,887	\$ 143,469
Net investment income	75,728	(17,821)
Benefit payments, including refunds of member contributions	<u>(92,368)</u>	<u>(104,946)</u>
Administrative expense	<u>(23,691)</u>	<u>(22,818)</u>
Net Change in Plan Fiduciary Net Position	66,556	(2,116)
Plan Fiduciary Net Position – Beginning	1,578,806	1,645,362
Plan Fiduciary Net Position – Ending (b)	<u>\$ 1,645,362</u>	<u>\$ 1,643,246</u>
Net Pension Liability – Ending (a-b)	<u>\$ 442,389</u>	<u>\$ 560,433</u>
Plan Fiduciary Net Position as a Percentage of the Total Pension Liability	78.8%	74.6%
Estimated Covered Employee Payroll	\$ 331,371	\$ 269,934
Net Pension Liability as a Percentage of Covered Employee Payroll	133.5%	207.6%

TURTLE CREEK BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF CHANGES IN THE NET PENSION
LIABILITY AND RELATED RATIOS
FOR THE YEARS ENDED DECEMBER 31, 2016 AND 2017

	<u>2016</u>	<u>2017</u>
Total Pension Liability		
Service cost	\$ 38,755	\$ 12,641
Interest	157,448	184,506
Difference between expected and actual experience	-	267,192
Changes of assumptions	-	71,272
Benefit payments, including refunds of member contributions	(143,994)	(126,382)
Net Change in Total Pension Liability	<u>52,209</u>	<u>409,229</u>
Total Pension Liability – Beginning	2,203,679	2,255,888
Total Pension Liability – Ending (a)	<u>\$ 2,255,888</u>	<u>\$ 2,665,117</u>
Plan Fiduciary Net Position		
Contributions – employer	\$ 142,158	\$ 157,690
Net investment income	69,848	223,026
Benefit payments, including refunds of member contributions	(143,994)	(126,382)
Administrative expense	(29,911)	(26,141)
Net Change in Plan Fiduciary Net Position	<u>38,101</u>	<u>228,193</u>
Plan Fiduciary Net Position – Beginning	1,643,246	1,681,347
Plan Fiduciary Net Position – Ending (b)	<u>\$ 1,681,347</u>	<u>\$ 1,909,540</u>
Net Pension Liability – Ending (a-b)	<u>\$ 574,541</u>	<u>\$ 755,577</u>
Plan Fiduciary Net Position as a Percentage of the Total Pension Liability	74.5%	71.6%
Estimated Covered Employee Payroll	\$ 284,089	\$ 311,837
Net Pension Liability as a Percentage of Covered Employee Payroll	202.2%	242.3%

TURTLE CREEK BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
 (UNAUDITED)

Sensitivity of the Net Pension Liability to Changes in the Discount Rate

The following presents the net pension liability of the borough as of December 31, 2015, 2016, and 2017, calculated using the discount rate of 7.25%, as well as what the borough's net pension liability would be if it were calculated using a discount rate that is 1 percentage-point lower or 1 percentage-point higher than the current rate:

	1% Decrease (6.25%)	Current Discount Rate (7.25%)	1% Increase (8.25%)
Net Pension Liability – 12/31/15	\$ 795,220	\$ 560,433	\$ 362,030
Net Pension Liability – 12/31/16	\$ 812,624	\$ 574,541	\$ 373,243
Net Pension Liability – 12/31/17	\$ 1,019,138	\$ 755,577	\$ 534,050

SCHEDULE OF CONTRIBUTIONS

Year Ended December 31	Actuarially Determined Contribution	Actual Contributions	Contribution Deficiency (Excess)	Covered- Employee Payroll*	Contributions as a Percentage of Covered- Employee Payroll
2008	\$ 45,076	\$ 61,754	\$ (16,678)	\$ 341,091	18.1%
2009	54,517	71,417	(16,900)		
2010	73,792	73,792	-	335,700	22.0%
2011	104,836	104,836	-		
2012	98,681	98,681	-	314,162	31.4%
2013	103,747	103,747	-		
2014	106,887	106,887	-	331,371	32.3%
2015	143,469	143,469	-	269,934	53.1%
2016	142,158	142,158	-	284,089	50.0%
2017	157,690	157,690	-	311,837	50.6%

* Due to GASB Statement No. 67, *Financial Reporting for Pension Plans*, being implemented only recently, the amount of Covered-Employee Payroll was not provided for odd years prior to 2014.

TURTLE CREEK BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF INVESTMENT RETURNS

Annual Money-Weighted Rate of Return, Net of Investment Expense:

2017	13.70%
2016	4.40%
2015	(1.11%)

TURTLE CREEK BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
 (UNAUDITED)

SCHEDULE OF FUNDING PROGRESS

Historical trend information about the plan is presented herewith as supplementary information. It is intended to help users assess the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis, assess progress made in accumulating assets to pay benefits when due, and make comparisons with other state and local government retirement systems.

The actuarial information is required by Act 205 biennially. The historical information, beginning as of January 1, 2013, is as follows:

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Actuarial Valuation Date	Actuarial Value of Assets (a)	Actuarial Accrued Liability (AAL) - Entry Age (b)	Unfunded (Assets in Excess of) Actuarial Accrued Liability (b) - (a)	Funded Ratio (a)/(b)
01-01-13	\$ 1,376,710	\$ 1,879,016	\$ 502,306	73.3%
01-01-15	1,601,310	2,097,795	496,485	76.3%
01-01-17	1,792,217	2,594,352	802,135	69.1%

Note: The market values of the plan's assets at 01-01-13, 01-01-15, and 01-01-17 have been adjusted to reflect the smoothing of gains and/or losses over a 4-year averaging period. This method will lower contributions in years of less than expected returns and increase contributions in years of greater than expected returns. The net effect over long periods of time is to have less variance in contribution levels from year to year.

TURTLE CREEK BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
(UNAUDITED)

The comparability of trend information is affected by changes in actuarial assumptions, benefit provisions, actuarial funding methods, accounting policies, and other changes. Those changes usually affect trends in contribution requirements and in ratios that use the actuarial accrued liability as a factor.

Analysis of the dollar amount of the actuarial value of assets, actuarial accrued liability, and unfunded (assets in excess of) actuarial accrued liability in isolation can be misleading. Expressing the actuarial value of assets as a percentage of the actuarial accrued liability (Column 4) provides one indication of the plan's funding status on a going-concern basis. Analysis of this percentage, over time, indicates whether the system is becoming financially stronger or weaker. Generally, the greater this percentage, the stronger the plan.

TURTLE CREEK BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
NOTES TO SUPPLEMENTARY SCHEDULES
(UNAUDITED)

The information presented in the supplementary schedules was determined as part of the actuarial valuation at the date indicated. Additional information as of the latest actuarial valuation date follows:

Actuarial valuation date	January 1, 2017
Actuarial cost method	Entry age normal
Amortization method	Level dollar
Remaining amortization period	4 years (aggregate)
Asset valuation method	Fair value, 4-year smoothing
Actuarial assumptions:	
Investment rate of return	7.25%
Projected salary increases *	5.0%

* Includes inflation at 3.0%.

TURTLE CREEK BOROUGH POLICE PENSION PLAN
REPORT DISTRIBUTION LIST

This report was initially distributed to the following:

The Honorable Tom W. Wolf
Governor
Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

The Honorable Kelley Kelley
Mayor

Mr. Nick Bianchi
Council President

Mr. Max Spencer
Council Vice-President

Ms. Connie Tinsley
Council Member

Mr. Mark Nolan
Council Member

Mr. Brian Estocin
Council Member

Mr. Jack Osman
Council Member

Ms. Jill Henkel
Council Member

Ms. Julie Pantalone
Borough Administrator

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at www.PaAuditor.gov. Media questions about the report can be directed to the Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor General, Office of Communications, 229 Finance Building, Harrisburg, PA 17120; via email to: news@PaAuditor.gov.